#### UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT EASTERN DISTRICT OF VIRGINIA NORFOLK DIVISION

I/P ENGINE, INC.,		)))
	Plaintiff,	) ) `
v.		)
AOL, INC. et al.,		) ) )
	Defendants.	) ) )

Civ. Action No. 2:11-cv-512

#### MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT I/P ENGINE'S MOTION TO SEAL EXHIBIT 1 TO PLAINTIFF I/P ENGINE, INC.'S MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT OF ITS DAUBERT MOTION, AND FOURTH MOTION IN LIMINE, TO EXCLUDE LYLE UNGAR'S NEW THEORY OF INVALIDITY AND OPINIONS REGARDING CLAIM CONSTRUCTION

In support of its Motion to Seal pursuant to Local Rule 5, Plaintiff I/P Engine, Inc. ("I/P

Engine") states the following:

1. I/P Engine moves the Court for leave to file under seal Exhibit 1 to its

Memorandum in Support of Plaintiff I/P Engine's Daubert Motion, and Fourth Motion in

Limine, to Exclude Lyle Ungar's New Theory of Invalidity and Opinions Regarding Claim

Construction. The afore-mentioned contain information that is marked as confidential by

Defendants under the Protective Order entered in this matter on January 23, 2012 (D.I. No. 85)

("Protective Order").

2. There are three requirements for sealing court findings: (1) public notice with an opportunity to object; (2) consideration of less drastic alternatives; and (3) a statement of specific findings in support of a decision to seal and rejecting alternatives to sealing. *See, e.g., Flexible* 

DSMDB-3100688

*Benefits Council v. Feldman*, No. 1:08-CV-371, 2008 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 93039 (E.D. Va. Nov 13, 2008) (citing *Ashcroft v. Conoco, Inc.*, 218 F.3d 282, 288 (4th Cir. 2000)). I/P Engine's Exhibit 1 to its Memorandum in Support of Plaintiff I/P Engine's Daubert Motion, and Fourth Motion in Limine, to Exclude Lyle Ungar's New Theory of Invalidity and Opinions Regarding Claim Construction contains information that is marked by Defendants as confidential. An in camera copy of the afore-mentioned is being provided to the Court. In light of Defendant's representation that this is confidential material under the Protective Order, there appears to be no alternative that appropriately serves Defendants' confidentiality concerns.

3. The information contained in the exhibit contains Google's proprietary and confidential information.

4. For the sake of consistency with practices governing the case as a whole, I/P Engine believes Exhibit 1 should remain sealed and be treated in accordance with the terms and conditions of the Protective Order.

5. Accordingly, and in satisfaction of the requirements of Local Rule 5, I/P Engine respectfully asks the Court to enter the Proposed Agreed Order sealing Exhibit 1 to its Memorandum in Support of Plaintiff I/P Engine's Daubert Motion, and Fourth Motion in Limine, to Exclude Lyle Ungar's New Theory of Invalidity and Opinions Regarding Claim Construction.

Dated: September 24, 2012

By: <u>/s/ Jeffrey K. Sherwood</u> Donald C. Schultz (Virginia Bar No. 30531) W. Ryan Snow (Virginia Bar No. 47423) CRENSHAW, WARE & MARTIN PLC 150 West Main Street Norfolk, VA 23510 Telephone: (757) 623-3000 Facsimile: (757) 623-5735

Jeffrey K. Sherwood (Virginia Bar No. 19222) Frank C. Cimino, Jr. Kenneth W. Brothers DeAnna Allen Charles J. Monterio, Jr. DICKSTEIN SHAPIRO LLP 1825 Eye Street, NW Washington, DC 20006 Telephone: (202) 420-2200 Facsimile: (202) 420-2201

Counsel for Plaintiff I/P Engine, Inc.

### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on this 24th day of September, 2012, the foregoing MOTION TO

# SEAL EXHIBIT 1 TO PLAINTIFF I/P ENGINE, INC.'S MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT

## OF ITS DAUBERT MOTION, AND FOURTH MOTION IN LIMINE, TO EXCLUDE

## LYLE UNGAR'S NEW THEORY OF INVALIDITY AND OPINIONS REGARDING

CLAIM CONSTRUCTION, was served via the Court's CM/ECF system, on the following:

Stephen Edward Noona Kaufman & Canoles, P.C. 150 W Main St Suite 2100 Norfolk, VA 23510 senoona@kaufcan.com

David Bilsker David Perlson Quinn Emanuel Urquhart & Sullivan LLP 50 California Street, 22nd Floor San Francisco, CA 94111 <u>davidbilsker@quinnemanuel.com</u> <u>davidperlson@quinnemanuel.com</u>

Robert L. Burns Finnegan, Henderson, Farabow, Garrett & Dunner, LLP Two Freedom Square 11955 Freedom Drive Reston, VA 20190 <u>robert.burns@finnegan.com</u>

Cortney S. Alexander Finnegan, Henderson, Farabow, Garrett & Dunner, LLP 3500 SunTrust Plaza 303 Peachtree Street, NE Atlanta, GA 94111 cortney.alexander@finnegan.com

/s/ Jeffrey K. Sherwood