

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
EASTERN DISTRICT OF VIRGINIA  
NORFOLK DIVISION**

I/P ENGINE, INC.

Plaintiff,

v.

AOL INC., *et al.*,

Defendants.

Civil Action No. 2:11-cv-512

**MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT OF MOTION TO SEAL  
PORTIONS OF EXHIBIT 1 TO THE O'BRIEN DECLARATION IN SUPPORT OF  
DEFENDANTS' MOTION FOR SANCTIONS AND TO STRIKE PORTIONS OF DR.  
FRIEDER'S SECOND UPDATED EXPERT REPORT**

In support of their Motion to Seal pursuant to Local Rule 5, and the Protective Order entered in this matter on January 23, 2012 (Dkt. No. 85), Defendants Google Inc., Target Corporation, IAC Search & Media, Inc., Gannett Co., Inc. and AOL Inc. (collectively "Defendants") state the following:

1. Defendants have moved the court for leave to file under seal Portions of Exhibit 1 to the O'Brien Declaration in Support of Defendants' Motion for Sanctions and to Strike Portions of Dr. Frieder's Second Updated Expert Report ("Portions of O'Brien Dec. Ex. 1").

2. Portions of O'Brien Dec. Ex. 1 contain data that is confidential under the Protective Order.

3. There are three requirements for sealing court findings: (1) public notice with an opportunity to object; (2) consideration of less drastic alternatives; and (3) a statement of specific findings in support of a decision to seal and rejecting alternatives to sealing. *See, e.g., Flexible Benefits Council v. Feldman*, No. 1:08-CV-371, 2008 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 93039 (E.D. Va. Nov.

13, 2008) (citing *Ashcraft v. Conoco, Inc.*, 218 F.3d 282, 288 (4<sup>th</sup> Cir. 2000)). Defendants contend that Portions of O'Brien Dec. Ex. 1 contain data that is confidential under the Protective Order. Defendants specifically state as reasons for sealing the requested pleadings that the Portions of O'Brien Dec. Ex. 1 contain confidential Google technical information that is not generally known, that has economic value, and would cause competitive harm if made public. In particular, proposed O'Brien Dec. Ex. 1 contains lengthy descriptions of the operations of the Google accused systems which Google contends are highly confidential for all the reasons set forth in their Motion to Close the Courtroom, and Declarations filed in Support thereof (D.N. 346 and 348-351). Defendants have made all reasonable efforts to limit their redactions in compliance with the law of this Circuit.

4. *In camera* copies of the Portions of O'Brien Dec. Ex. 1 have been forwarded to the Court. In light of Defendants' concerns and the Protective Order, there appears to be no alternative that appropriately serves Defendants' expressed confidentiality concerns.

5. For the sake of consistency with practices governing the case as a whole, Portions of O'Brien Dec. Ex. 1 should remain sealed and be treated in accordance with the terms and conditions of the Protective Order.

Accordingly, and in satisfaction of the requirements of Local Rule 5, Defendants respectfully ask the Court to seal Portions of O'Brien Dec. Ex. 1

DATED: October 14, 2012

/s/ Stephen E. Noona

Stephen E. Noona  
Virginia State Bar No. 25367  
KAUFMAN & CANOLES, P.C.  
150 West Main Street, Suite 2100  
Norfolk, VA 23510  
Telephone: (757) 624-3000  
Facsimile: (757) 624-3169

senoona@kaufcan.com

David Bilsker  
David A. Perlson  
QUINN EMANUEL URQUHART &  
SULLIVAN, LLP  
50 California Street, 22nd Floor  
San Francisco, California 94111  
Telephone: (415) 875-6600  
Facsimile: (415) 875-6700  
davidbilsker@quinnemanuel.com  
davidperlson@quinnemanuel.com

*Counsel for Google Inc., Target Corporation,  
IAC Search & Media, Inc., and Gannett Co., Inc.*

By: /s/ Stephen E. Noona

Stephen E. Noona  
Virginia State Bar No. 25367  
KAUFMAN & CANOLES, P.C.  
150 W. Main Street, Suite 2100  
Norfolk, VA 23510  
Telephone: (757) 624-3000  
Facsimile: (757) 624-3169  
senoona@kaufcan.com

Robert L. Burns  
FINNEGAN, HENDERSON, FARABOW, GARRETT &  
DUNNER, LLP  
Two Freedom Square  
11955 Freedom Drive  
Reston, VA 20190  
Telephone: (571) 203-2700  
Facsimile: (202) 408-4400

Cortney S. Alexander  
FINNEGAN, HENDERSON, FARABOW, GARRETT &  
DUNNER, LLP  
3500 SunTrust Plaza  
303 Peachtree Street, NE  
Atlanta, GA 94111  
Telephone: (404) 653-6400  
Facsimile: (415) 653-6444

*Counsel for Defendant AOL Inc.*



## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on October 14, 2012, I will electronically file the foregoing with the Clerk of Court using the CM/ECF system, which will send a notification of such filing (NEF) to the following:

Jeffrey K. Sherwood  
Kenneth W. Brothers  
DICKSTEIN SHAPIRO LLP  
1825 Eye Street NW  
Washington, DC 20006  
Telephone: (202) 420-2200  
Facsimile: (202) 420-2201  
[sherwoodj@dicksteinshapiro.com](mailto:sherwoodj@dicksteinshapiro.com)  
[brothersk@dicksteinshapiro.com](mailto:brothersk@dicksteinshapiro.com)

Donald C. Schultz  
W. Ryan Snow  
Steven Stancliff  
CRENSHAW, WARE & MARTIN, P.L.C.  
150 West Main Street, Suite 1500  
Norfolk, VA 23510  
Telephone: (757) 623-3000  
Facsimile: (757) 623-5735  
[dschultz@cwm-law.com](mailto:dschultz@cwm-law.com)  
[wrsnow@cwm-law.com](mailto:wrsnow@cwm-law.com)  
[sstancliff@cwm-law.com](mailto:sstancliff@cwm-law.com)

*Counsel for Plaintiff, I/P Engine, Inc.*

Craig C. Reilly Esq.  
Law Office of Craig C. Reilly  
111 Oronoco Street  
Alexandria, VA 22314  
Telephone: (703) 549-5354  
Facsimile: (703) 549-2604  
[craig.reilly@ccreillylaw.com](mailto:craig.reilly@ccreillylaw.com)

Craig T. Merritt  
Christian & Barton, LLP  
909 E. Main Street, Suite 1200  
Richmond VA 23219-3095  
Telephone: (804) 697-4128  
Facsimile: (804) 697-6128  
[cmerritt@cblaw.com](mailto:cmerritt@cblaw.com)

Roderick G. Dorman (pro hac vice)  
Jeanne Irving (pro hac vice)  
Alan P. Block (pro hac vice)  
Jeffrey Huang (pro hac vice)  
McKool Smith Hennigan P.C.  
865 South Figueroa Street, Suite 2900  
Los Angeles, CA 90017  
Telephone: (213) 694-1200  
Facsimile: (213) 694-1234  
rdorman@mckoolsmithhennigan.com  
jirving@mckoolsmithhennigan.com  
ablock@mckoolsmithhennigan.com  
jhuang@mckoolsmithhennigan.com

Douglas A. Cawley (pro hac vice)  
McKool Smith P.C.  
300 Crescent Court, Suite 1500  
Dallas, TX 75201  
Telephone: (214) 978-4000  
Facsimile: (214) 978-4044  
dcawley@mckoolsmithhennigan.com  
acurry@mckoolsmithhennigan.com

*Counsel for Plaintiff Suffolk Technologies, LLC*

/s/ Stephen E. Noona  
Stephen E. Noona  
Virginia State Bar No. 25367  
KAUFMAN & CANOLES, P.C.  
150 West Main Street, Suite 2100  
Norfolk, VA 23510  
Telephone: (757) 624-3000  
Facsimile: (757) 624-3169  
senoona@kaufcan.com