

Exhibit 1**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
EASTERN DISTRICT OF VIRGINIA
NORFOLK DIVISION**

I/P ENGINE, INC.

Plaintiff,

v.

AOL INC., *et al.*,

Defendants.

Civil Action No. 2:11-cv-512

PROPOSED ORDER

Before the Court is the Motion to Seal (“Defendants’ Motion to Seal”) filed by Defendants Google Inc., Target Corporation, IAC Search & Media, Inc., Gannett Co., Inc. and AOL Inc. (collectively “Defendants”).

After considering the Motion to Seal, Order and related filings, the Court is of the opinion that the Motion to Seal should be granted. It is therefore ORDERED as follows:

1. Defendants have asked to file under seal (1) Portions of Defendants’ Memorandum In Opposition To Plaintiff’s Motion For Post-Judgment Royalties (“Portions of Defendants’ Opposition”), (2) Portions of the Declaration of Keith Ugone, Ph.D. (“Ugone Declaration and Certain Exhibits Thereto”), (3) Exhibits 2-21 to the Declaration of Margaret Kammerud (“Certain Exhibits to the Kammerud Declaration”) and (4) Portions of the Declaration of Bartholomew Furrow in Support of Defendants’ Opposition (“Furrow Declaration”) as they contain data that is confidential under the Protective Order entered in this matter on January 23, 2012 (Doc. No. 85) (“Protective Order”).

2. There are three requirements for sealing court filings: (1) public notice with an opportunity to object; (2) consideration of less drastic alternatives; and (3) a statement of specific findings in support of a decision to seal and rejecting alternatives to sealing. *See, e.g., Flexible Benefits Council v. Feldman*, No. 1:08-CV-371, 2008 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 93039 (E.D. Va. Nov. 13, 2008) (citing *Ashcraft v. Conoco, Inc.*, 218 F.3d 282, 288 (4th Cir. 2000)).

3. This Court finds that Portions of Defendants' Opposition, the Ugone Declaration, Certain Exhibits to the Kammerud Declaration, and the Furrow Declaration contain data that is confidential under the Protective Order; that public notice has been given, that no objections have been filed; that the public's interest in access is outweighed by the interests in preserving such confidentiality; and that there are no alternatives that appropriately serve these interests.

4. Specifically, the Court finds the following reasons for sealing the requested pleadings: Portions of Defendants' Opposition, the Ugone Declaration, Certain Exhibits to the Kammerud Declaration, and the Furrow Declaration contain confidential financial information, information regarding confidential third party agreements, sensitive, confidential technical information relating to Google's technology, and sensitive, confidential technical information relating to an alternative construction of the accused system, all of which are not generally known, have economic value, and the disclosure of which would cause competitive harm if made widely public. The Court also finds that by filing narrowly redacted public pleadings, the Defendants have made all reasonable efforts to limit their redactions in compliance with the law of this Circuit.

5. *In camera* copies of Portions of Defendants' Opposition, the Ugone Declaration, Certain Exhibits to the Kammerud Declaration, and the Furrow Declaration have been reviewed by the Court. In light of Defendants' concerns and the Protective Order, there appears to be no

alternative other than the narrowly redacted public pleadings that appropriately serves Defendants' expressed confidentiality concerns.

6. For the sake of consistency with practices governing the case as a whole, Portions of Defendants' Opposition, the Ugone Declaration, Certain Exhibits to the Kammerud Declaration, and the Furrow Declaration shall remain sealed and be treated in accordance with the terms and conditions of the Protective Order.

Accordingly, it is ORDERED that Portions of Defendants' Opposition, the Ugone Declaration, Exhibits 2-21 to the Kammerud Declaration, and the Furrow Declaration shall be filed under seal. The Court shall retain sealed materials until forty-five (45) days after entry of a final order after appeal.

Entered: ____/____/____

United States District Court
Eastern District of Virginia

WE ASK FOR THIS:

/s/Stephen E. Noona
Stephen E. Noona
Virginia State Bar No. 25367
KAUFMAN & CANOLES, P.C.
150 West Main Street, Suite 2100
Norfolk, VA 23510
Telephone: (757) 624-3000
Facsimile: (757) 624-3169
senoona@kaufcan.com

David Bilsker
David A. Perlson
QUINN EMANUEL URQUHART &
SULLIVAN, LLP
50 California Street, 22nd Floor
San Francisco, California 94111
Telephone: (415) 875-6600
Facsimile: (415) 875-6700
davidbilsker@quinnemanuel.com
davidperlson@quinnemanuel.com

*Counsel for Defendants Google Inc.,
Target Corporation, IAC Search &
Media, Inc., and Gannett Co., Inc.*

/s/ Stephen E. Noona
Stephen E. Noona
Virginia State Bar No. 25367
KAUFMAN & CANOLES, P.C.
150 West Main Street, Suite 2100
Norfolk, VA 23510
Telephone: (757) 624-3000
Facsimile: (757) 624-3169
senoona@kaufcan.com

Robert L. Burns
FINNEGAN, HENDERSON, FARABOW,
GARRETT & DUNNER, LLP
Two Freedom Square
11955 Freedom Drive
Reston, VA 20190
Telephone: (571) 203-2700
Facsimile: (202) 408-4400

Courtney S. Alexander
FINNEGAN, HENDERSON, FARABOW,
GARRETT & DUNNER, LLP
3500 SunTrust Plaza
303 Peachtree Street, NE
Atlanta, GA 94111
Telephone: (404) 653-6400
Facsimile: (415) 653-6444

Counsel for Defendant AOL Inc.

12391543v2