

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF VIRGINIA
Richmond Division**

COMMONWEALTH OF VIRGINIA
EX REL. KENNETH T. CUCCINELLI, II,
in his official capacity as Attorney General
of Virginia,

Plaintiff,

v.

KATHLEEN SEBELIUS, Secretary of the
Department of Health and Human Services,
in her official capacity,

Defendant.

Civil Action No. 3:10-cv-188-HEH

**MOTION OF AMERICAN CIVIL RIGHTS UNION
FOR LEAVE TO FILE *AMICUS CURIAE* BRIEF
IN SUPPORT OF PLAINTIFF'S MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT
AND IN OPPOSITION TO DEFENDANT'S MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT**

The American Civil Rights Union (ACRU) moves for leave to file the accompanying *amicus curiae* brief in support of Plaintiff's motion for summary judgment and in opposition to Defendant's motion for summary judgment.

I. INTEREST OF MOVANT

The American Civil Rights Union (ACRU) is a non-partisan, non-profit 501(c)(3) legal/educational policy organization dedicated to defending all constitutional rights, not just those that might be politically correct or fit a particular ideology. It was founded in 1998 by long-time policy advisor to President Reagan, and the architect of modern welfare reform, Robert B. Carleson, and since then has filed *amicus curiae* briefs on constitutional law issues in cases nationwide.

Those setting the organization's policy as members of the Policy Board are former U.S. Attorney General, Edwin Meese III; former Assistant Attorney General for Civil Rights, William Bradford Reynolds; John M. Olin Distinguished Professor of Economics at George Mason University, Walter E. Williams; former Harvard University Professor, Dr. James Q. Wilson; former Ambassador Curtin Winsor, Jr.; and Dean Emeritus of the UCLA Anderson School of Management, J. Clayburn LaForce.

This case is of interest to the ACRU because it seeks to ensure that the Constitutional limits to federal power are fully recognized and enforced. That includes, in regard to this case in particular, that the scope and boundaries of the Commerce Clause be fully respected and maintained, and properly applied to analysis of the constitutionality of the Patient Protection and Affordable Care Act.

II. AN *AMICUS CURIAE* BRIEF IS DESIRABLE AND THE MATTERS ASSERTED ARE RELEVANT TO THE DISPOSITION OF THE CASE.

The ACRU has long experience and developed expertise in addressing issues of constitutional law, having filed numerous *amicus curiae* briefs addressing such issues nationwide. *See, e.g., NRA v. City of Chicago* (2010); *Citizens United v. Federal Election Commission* (2010); *Free Enterprise Fund v. Pub. Co. Accounting Oversight Bd.* (2010); *Ricci v. City of New Haven* (2009); *District of Columbia v. Heller* (2008); *Boy Scouts of America v. Dale* (2000).

In addition to the expertise of its Policy Board, the ACRU's General Counsel, Peter Ferrara, has taken the lead in producing the organization's *amicus curiae* briefs, including the attached brief for this case. A graduate of Harvard Law School and Harvard College, Mr. Ferrara served in the White House Office of Policy Development under President Reagan, where his responsibilities included health policy. He also served as Associate Deputy Attorney General of

the United States under President George H. W. Bush, and as an Associate Professor of Law at the George Mason University School of Law. He has also practiced with law firms in New York and Washington.

The attached brief includes an original and unique discussion of the economic aspects of the legal issues raised by the Commerce Clause analysis of the Patient Protection and Affordable Health Care Act. It demonstrates, moreover, that alternative policies were available to the Congress that would have achieved its policy goals, yet would not transgress Constitutional bounds, as the Act the Congress passed does. The Act imposes an individual mandate on individuals not participating in interstate commerce, but its effect is not so limited. The mandate in fact compels them to participate in something that *is not* interstate commerce, as the attached brief demonstrates. The Commerce Clause thus provides no authorization for the individual mandate, nor does any other delegated power under the Constitution. The individual mandate, therefore, is unconstitutional. Failing to so rule would fundamentally transform the Constitution from providing for a limited government of delegated powers, to an unlimited government of unlimited powers.

The ACRU submits the attached brief because of its demonstrated legal policy and public policy interest in the issues presented by this case. But the ACRU has no direct interest, financial or otherwise, in the outcome of this lawsuit. Because of this lack of direct interest, the ACRU believes it can assist the Court by providing a perspective that is distinct from that of any party.

Counsel for the ACRU contacted each party in an effort to obtain consent for leave to file the attached *amicus curiae* brief. Counsel for Plaintiff consented to the filing of that brief. Counsel for Defendant took no position on the filing of the brief. In any event, this motion obviates the issue of any such consents.

WHEREFORE, the ACRU respectfully requests that its motion for leave to file the attached *amicus curiae* brief be granted. A proposed order is attached.

DATED: October 4, 2010

Respectfully Submitted,

/s/

Daniel M. Gray (VSB #39942)
Law Offices of Daniel M. Gray, LLC
7617 Virginia Avenue
Falls Church, VA 22043
703-204-0164
Fax 703-204-1449
graydm2@verizon.net

Richard B. Rogers (VSB #43148)
Richard B. Rogers plc
6606 Thurlton Drive
Alexandria, VA 22315-2649
571-969-1727
(Fax: Please call first)
Richard_B_Rogers@msn.com

Peter Ferrara
General Counsel
American Civil Rights Union
1232 Pine Hill Rd.
McLean, VA 22101
703-582-8466
610-438-5721

*Counsel for Amicus Curiae
American Civil Rights Union*

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on this 4th day of October, 2010, I electronically filed the foregoing Motion for Leave to File *Amicus Curiae* Brief via the Court's CM/ECF system, which will send notification of such filing to the following counsel registered for electronic service:

Kenneth T. Cuccinelli
Earle Duncan Getchell, Jr.
Charles E. James, Jr.
Stephen R. McCullough
Wesley Glenn Russell, Jr.
OFFICE OF THE ATTORNEY
GENERAL OF VIRGINIA
900 E. Main Street
Richmond, Virginia 23219
(Counsel for Plaintiff)

Jonathan Holland Hambrick
OFFICE OF THE U.S. ATTORNEY
600 E. Main St., Suite 1800
Richmond, Virginia 23219
(Counsel for Defendant)

Erika Myers
Ian Gershengorn
Joel McElvain
Shelia M. Leiber
UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE
FEDERAL PROGRAMS BRANCH
20 Massachusetts Ave., NW
Room 7332
Washington, DC 20001
(Counsel for Defendant)

Matthew D. Fender
Virginia L.H. Nesbitt
Scott C. Oostdyk
McGuire Woods LLP
901 East Cary Street
Richmond, VA 23219
(Counsel for *amicus* Physician Hospitals
of America)

John P. Forest, II
Stahl Zelloe PC
11350 Random Hills Road
Suite 700
Fairfax, VA 22030
(Counsel for *amicus* Liberty Group)

Angela H. France
PCT Law Group, PLLC
1725 Duke Street
Suite 240
Alexandria, VA 22314
(Counsel for nineteen *amici*)

Colby M. May
American Center for Law & Justice
(DC)
201 Maryland Avenue NE
Washington, DC 20002
(Counsel for thirty *amici*)

Patrick M. McSweeney
George W. Norris, Jr.
McSweeney Crump Childress & Temple
PC
11 South Twelfth Street
5th Floor
Richmond, VA 23219
(Counsel for three *amici*)

Andrew A. Nicely
Mayer Brown LLP
1999 K Street NW
Washington, DC 20006-1101
(Counsel for *amicus* Constitutional Law
Professors)

Richard A. Samp
Washington Legal Foundation (DC)
2009 Massachusetts Avenue NW
Washington, DC 20036
(Counsel for *amicus* Washington Legal
Foundation)

Timothy J. St. George
Troutman Sanders LLP
Troutman Sanders Building
1001 Haxall Point
PO Box 1122
Richmond, VA 23218-1122
(Counsel for *amicus* Landmark Legal
Foundation)

John H. Young
SD Smith Esquire PLLC
2001 South Main Street, Suite 207-F
Blacksburg, VA 24060
(Counsel for *amici* Main Street Alliance
and Small Business Majority
Foundation, Inc.)

I further certify that I will serve a true and correct copy of the foregoing via U.S. Mail, postage prepaid, on the following individual listed as a participant in this case who is not registered with the CM/ECF system:

Ray E. Parker
PO Box 320636
Alexandria, VA 22320
(*Amicus* appearing *pro se*)

/s/
Daniel M. Gray (VSB #39942)
Law Offices of Daniel M. Gray, LLC
7617 Virginia Avenue
Falls Church, VA 22043
703-204-0164
Fax 703-204-1449
graydm2@verizon.net

Richard B. Rogers (VSB #43148)
Richard B. Rogers plc
6606 Thurlton Drive
Alexandria, VA 22315-2649
571-969-1727
(Fax: Please call first)
Richard_B_Rogers@msn.com

Peter Ferrara
General Counsel
American Civil Rights Union
1232 Pine Hill Rd.
McLean, VA 22101
703-582-8466
610-438-5721

*Counsel for Amicus Curiae
American Civil Rights Union*