

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF VIRGINIA  
Richmond Division**

AARON TOBEY,	)	
	)	
Plaintiff,	)	
	)	
V.	)	Civil Action No. 3:11cv154-HEH
	)	
JANET NAPOLITANO, et al.,	)	
	)	
Defendants.	)	

**PLAINTIFF’S RESPONSE CLARIFYING POSITION ON DEFENDANTS’  
MOTION FOR STAY OF PROCEEDINGS PENDING APPEAL**

and

**MOTION FOR LEAVE TO FILE SECOND AMENDED COMPLAINT  
UNDER SEAL**

Plaintiff Aaron Tobey hereby files this response clarifying his position on the motion for stay of proceedings pending appeal filed by Defendants Rebecca Smith and Terri Jones (collectively the “TSOs”) and further requests leave to file under seal his Second Amended Complaint containing the actual name of Defendant Jane Doe.<sup>1</sup>

**Position on Motion to Stay**

While Plaintiff believes that federal government’s appeal and unwillingness to participate in discovery renders a stay necessary, we respectfully request the Court to decide Defendant Jane Doe’s pending motion to dismiss the Second Amended Complaint. That decision can then be incorporated into the appellate proceedings in the interests of judicial economy and to “materially advance the ultimate termination of the litigation. . . .” *Cf.* 28 U.S.C. § 1292(b). Plaintiff has also been preparing a motion for

---

<sup>1</sup> Plaintiff was provided with Jane Doe’s full name immediately after he had filed his response to Defendant Jane Doe’s motion to dismiss this suit on Friday, November 4, 2011.

reconsideration of this Court's August 30, 2011 Order based on discovery received to date, including leave to amend the complaint to reflect the additional facts obtained during discovery. If we file the motion before the Court rules on the stay motion, we leave to the Court's discretion whether to rule on it then or when and if the case is remanded.<sup>2</sup>

**Motion For Leave to File Second Amended Complaint Under Seal**

In its October 2, 2011, Order granting Plaintiff leave to file the Second Amended Complaint, the Court directed Plaintiff "within ten (10) days of learning Jane Doe's full name, to notify the Court and seek further leave to amend his complaint accordingly." Plaintiff hereby advises the Court that his counsel received the full name of Defendant Jane Doe on November 4, 2011, and hereby requests leave to file under seal a supplemental Second Amended Complaint in the form previously filed, but containing in lieu of pseudonyms for Defendants Rebecca Smith, Terri Jones and Jane Doe, the actual names of said Defendants.

Dated this 8th of November, 2011.

Respectfully submitted,

By: /s/ James J. Knicely  
James J. Knicely (VSB #19356)

---

<sup>2</sup> For the Court's information, the status of discovery at the time of the filing of the interlocutory appeal was as follows: (i) Plaintiff and the Commission Defendants were scheduling depositions of four additional Commission witnesses, including one Defendant, (ii) none of the three Federal Defendants had been made available for depositions, despite repeated requests, (iii) two outstanding document subpoenas of this Court served on the University of Cincinnati Police Department and the U. S. Department of Homeland Security for response on November 4, 2011, were pending (and have as of this filing gone unanswered), and (iii) Plaintiff was in the process of serving a University of Cincinnati police lieutenant and a former airport police dispatcher with deposition subpoenas. Given the prejudice to Plaintiff from incomplete discovery, it is respectfully submitted that further proceedings beyond those mentioned above, and a motion to show cause and/or to compel production of the subpoenaed documents, would be inappropriate.

Robert Luther III (VSB #78766)  
KNICELY & ASSOCIATES, P.C.  
487 McLaws Circle, Suite 2  
Williamsburg, Virginia 23185  
(757) 253-0026 (phone)  
(757) 253-5825 (fax)  
jjk@knicelylaw.com

Anand Agneshwar (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Alan C. Veronick (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
ARNOLD & PORTER, LLP  
399 Park Avenue  
New York, New York 10022-4690  
(212) 715-1000 (phone)  
(212) 212-715.1399 (fax)  
anand.agneshwar@aporter.com  
*Of Counsel*

John W. Whitehead (VSB #20361)  
Douglas R. McKusick (VSB #72201)  
The Rutherford Institute  
1440 Sagem Place  
Charlottesville, Virginia 22906  
*Of Counsel*

Participating Attorneys for  
THE RUTHERFORD INSTITUTE

*Attorneys for Plaintiff, AARON TOBEY*

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on November 8, 2011, the foregoing Plaintiff's Response Clarifying Position On Defendants' Motion For Stay Of Proceedings Pending Appeal and Motion For Leave To File Second Amended Complaint Under Seal was electronically filed with the Clerk of Court using the CM/ECF system, which will send notification of such filing to:

Carlotta P. Wells, Esquire  
U.S. Department of Justice – Civil Division  
20 Massachusetts Avenue NW – Rm. 7152  
Washington, D.C. 20530  
carlotta.wells@usdoj.gov

Debra J. Prillaman, Esquire  
Robin Perrin Meier, Esquire  
Office of the United States Attorney for the Eastern District of Virginia  
600 East Main St., Suite 1800  
Richmond, Virginia 23219-2447  
debra.prillaman@usdoj.gov  
robin.p.meier2@usdoj.gov

Paul W. Jacobs, II, Esquire  
Henry I. Willett, Esquire  
Belinda D. Jones, Esquire  
CHRISTIAN & BARTON, LLP  
909 East Main St., Suite 1200  
Richmond, Virginia 23219-3095  
pjacobs@cblaw.com  
hwillett@cblaw.com  
bjones@cblaw.com

Respectfully Submitted,

By: /s/ James J. Knicely  
James J. Knicely (VSB #19356)  
KNICELY & ASSOCIATES, P.C.  
487 McLaws Circle, Suite 2  
Williamsburg, Virginia 23185  
(757) 253-0026 (phone)  
(757) 253-5825 (fax)  
jjk@knicelylaw.com

*Attorneys for Plaintiff, AARON TOBEY*