

THE HONORABLE MARSHA J. PECHMAN

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON
AT SEATTLE

AMAZON.COM, LLC,

Plaintiff,

v.

DAVID W. HOYLE, in his official capacity as
Secretary of the North Carolina Department of
Revenue,

Defendant.

No. 10-cv-00664-MJP

STIPULATED JUDGMENT RE
COMPLAINT IN INTERVENTION

JANE DOE 1, JANE DOE 2,
JANE DOE 3, JANE DOE 4,
JANE DOE 5, JANE DOE 6, AND
CECIL BOTHWELL,

Plaintiffs-Intervenors

v.

DAVID W. HOYLE, in his official capacity as
Secretary of the North Carolina Department of
Revenue and
AMAZON.COM, LLC,

Defendants in Intervention.

Plaintiffs-Intervenors Jane Does 1-6 and Cecil Bothwell and Defendant-in-Intervention
David W. Hoyle, in his official capacity as Secretary of the North Carolina Department of
Revenue, stipulate and agree as follows:

AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES
UNION OF WASHINGTON
901 Fifth Avenue, Suite 630
Seattle, Washington 98104-1799
(206) 624-2184

STIPULATED JUDGMENT - 1
10-cv-00664-MJP

1 1. Amazon.com LLC (“Amazon”) filed a complaint against the Secretary of the
2 North Carolina Department of Revenue (“DOR”), in his official capacity, captioned *Amazon.com*
3 *LLC v. Hoyle*, No. 2:10-cv-00664-MJP (Dkt. No. 1).

4 2. Plaintiffs-Intervenors Jane Does 1-6 and Cecil Bothwell (“Intervenors”) filed a
5 complaint in intervention in this action (Dkt. No. 61).

6 3. DOR subsequently filed motions to dismiss Amazon’s complaint (Dkt. No. 43)
7 and the complaint in intervention (Dkt. No. 64), and Amazon filed a motion for summary
8 judgment (Dkt. No. 44).

9 4. After briefing on the motions was completed and oral argument was held, the
10 Court issued an Order dated October 25, 2010 granting summary judgment to Amazon and
11 denying DOR’s motion to dismiss the complaint of Amazon and the complaint in intervention of
12 Intervenors (Dkt. No. 69).

13 5. The Court’s October 25 Order held that “much of the declaratory and injunctive
14 relief sought [by Intervenors] overlaps with the declaratory relief issued by this order [in favor of
15 Amazon].” Dkt. No. 69 at 24.

16 6. This stipulation does not constitute a concession, agreement or admission by
17 Defendant Hoyle as to the correctness or applicability of the declaratory relief granted in the
18 October 25 Order or that the Court has jurisdiction over Defendant or this matter.

19
20
21 THEREFORE, IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED, subject to the Court’s
22 approval, that:

23 1. As a result of the Court’s October 25 Order, it would be an unnecessary use of
24 judicial resources to further litigate Intervenors’ overlapping claims. Intervenors and Defendant
25 Hoyle therefore agree, for purposes of this action, that judgment shall be entered on behalf of
26 Intervenors providing the same declaratory relief as granted to Amazon in this action. *See* Dkt.
27 No. 69 at 24.

1 2. Intervenor agree to dismiss with prejudice the remaining claims for relief in their
2 complaint in intervention against Defendant Hoyle. See Complaint in Intervention (Dkt. No. 61)
3 at 32-33, ¶¶ c, d.

4 DATED this the 26th day of January, 2011

5 *Pro Hac Vice:*
6 **NORTH CAROLINA**
7 **ATTORNEY GENERAL ROY COOPER**
8 By: s/ Kay Linn Miller Hobart
9 Kay Linn Miller Hobart
10 Special Deputy Attorney General
11 N.C. State Bar No. 16746
12 Telephone: (919) 716-6550
13 Facsimile: (919) 715-3550
14 Email: khobart@ncdoj.gov

15 By: s/ Tiare B. Smiley
16 Tiare B. Smiley
17 Special Deputy Attorney General
18 N.C. State Bar No. 7719
19 Telephone: (919) 716-6900
20 Facsimile: (919) 716-6763
21 Email: tsmiley@ncdoj.gov
22 N.C. Department of Justice
23 P.O. Box 629
24 Raleigh, NC 27602

25 **MCKAY CHADWELL, PLLC**
26 By: s/ Michael D. McKay
27 Michael D. McKay
28 WSBA No. 7040

By: s/ Thomas M. Brennan
Thomas M. Brennan
WSBA No. 30662
600 University St., Suite. 1601
Seattle, WA 98101
Telephone: (206) 233-2800
Facsimile: (206) 233-2809
Email: tmb@mckay-chadwell.com

Attorneys for Defendant-in-Intervention

FOCAL PLLC
By: s/ Venkat Balasubramani
Venkat Balasubramani, WSBA #28269
8426 40th Ave SW
Seattle, WA 98136
Tel: (206) 529-4827
Fax: (206) 260-3966
Email: venkat@focallaw.com

AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION OF WASHINGTON FOUNDATION
Sarah A. Dunne, WSBA # 34869
901 Fifth Ave, Suite 630
Seattle, WA 98164
Tel: (206) 624-2184
Fax: (206) 624-2190
Email: dunne@aclu-wa.org

Pro Hac Vice:
AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION FOUNDATION
Speech, Privacy and Technology Project
Aden J. Fine
125 Broad Street, 18th Floor
New York, NY 10004
Tel: (212) 549-2500
Fax: (212) 549-2651
Email: afine@aclu.org

Pro Hac Vice:
AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION OF NORTH CAROLINA FOUNDATION
Katherine Lewis Parker
Post Office Box 28004
Raleigh, North Carolina 27611
Tel: (919) 834-3466
Fax: (866) 511-1344
Email: acluncklp@nc.rr.com
Attorneys for Plaintiffs-Intervenors

AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION OF WASHINGTON
901 Fifth Avenue, Suite 630
Seattle, Washington 98104-1799
(206) 624-2184

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

IT IS SO ORDERED.

Dated: January ____, 2011

MARSHA J. PECHMAN
United States District Court Judge

1 Presented by:

2 **FOCAL PLLC**

3 By: /s/ Venkat Balasubramani

4 Venkat Balasubramani, WSBA #28269

5 8426 40th Ave SW

6 Seattle, WA 98136

7 Tel: (206) 529-4827

8 Fax: (206) 260-3966

9 Email: venkat@focallaw.com

10 **AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION OF**
11 **WASHINGTON FOUNDATION**

12 Sarah A. Dunne, WSBA # 34869

13 901 Fifth Ave, Suite 630

14 Seattle, WA 98164

15 Tel: (206) 624-2184

16 Fax: (206) 624-2190

17 Email: dunne@aclu-wa.org

18 *Pro Hac Vice:*

19 **AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION**
20 **FOUNDATION**

21 **Speech, Privacy and Technology Project**

22 Aden J. Fine

23 125 Broad Street, 18th Floor

24 New York, NY 10004

25 Tel: (212) 549-2500

26 Fax: (212) 549-2651

27 Email: afine@aclu.org

28 *Pro Hac Vice:*

AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION OF
NORTH CAROLINA FOUNDATION

Katherine Lewis Parker

Post Office Box 28004

Raleigh, North Carolina 27611

Tel: (919) 834-3466

Fax: (866) 511-1344

Email: acluncklp@nc.rr.com

Attorneys for Plaintiffs-Intervenors