

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

The Honorable Richard A. Jones

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON
AT SEATTLE

PAUL ARMOUR, et al.,

Plaintiffs,

v.

REBECCA WILSON, et al.,

Defendants.

Case No. 2:12-cv-00851 RAJ

ORDER ON STIPULATED MOTION
OUTLINING COMPUTER AND EMAIL
EXAMINATION PROTOCOLS AND
PROTECTIONS

The court GRANTS the parties' stipulated motion (Dkt. # 80) for an order governing the examination of certain electronic evidence. The remainder of this order reproduces the parties' proposed order.

COMES NOW, the Parties, by and through undersigned counsel, and stipulate to the below protocols and protections as applied to the examination of the parties computers and emails, and respectfully requests that the Court enter the following order.

ORDER

THIS MATTER having come before the above captioned Court on the stipulation of the parties, hereby orders the following protocols and protections for the examination of the parties' computers and emails:

I. Data Necessary for Evaluating Forensic Images

The parties require copies of all images and emails created by their respective experts to conduct a forensic examination according to the below protocols. The parties will also require

1 copies of the acquisition forms, prepared contemporaneously with imaging the hard drives,
2 which should include: (1) Make, model, serial number and service tag (if available) of computer
3 as well as the Windows COA including the operating system and product key; and (2) Make,
4 model, serial number and size of the hard drives. If this information is not contained in the
5 acquisition forms, identification of the image file names should be matched up with the hard
6 drives and computers.

7 **II. Method of Searching Data**

8 **A. Computer Images**

9 All searches are restricted to the time period from November 1, 2011 through May 23,
10 2012. The images will be loaded into a computer forensic program called EnCase and may also
11 be loaded into computer forensic programs called X-Ways Forensics and/or AccessData's
12 Forensic Toolkit. Any hard drives that contain an Apple operating system may also be loaded
13 into a program called MacForensics Lab. The downloaded emails may be loaded into one of the
14 above programs or into another program called Proof Finder. For the hard drives, the parties will
15 identify the user profiles, the type and installation of the operating system, all software installed
16 on the computer and all hardware and networking devices.

17 **B. Internet Activity**

18 The experts may run a program called Internet Evidence Finder against all of the hard
19 drives. This program is designed to extract fragments of web-based email communications and
20 other internet activity. The parties will also review the computers to determine if any of them
21 were used to access the Armour and Chase Comcast email accounts, or the lindaflagery email
22 account. This search will also include IP address history for each computer, any logs
23 demonstrating text messages synchronized with the computer, internet logs, wireless logs for
24 computer, logs demonstrating the receipt of eBlaster reports, and logs of any backups or
25 alterations of the computers during the relevant time frame.

1 **C. Keyword Searches**

2 The experts will search the hard drives and the emails for a series of specific keywords or
3 keyword combinations. Depending on the results of the keyword searches, additional discussions
4 may need to take place between the parties to modify or enhance these keywords.

General Keywords
5 6 lindaflagery@hotmail.com 7 bard@abhc.com 8 paularmour@comcast.net 9 karilynnc@comcast.net 10 Linda Patterson 11 Eblaster 12 Spector Pro 13 Equifax 14 Experian 15 ConsumerInfo.com 16 FreeCreditScore.com 17 ProtectMyID.com 18 Experian.com 19 TD Ameritrade 20 WHPS (case sensitive) 21 ABHC 22 MyCharts 23 Swedish 24 *2335 25 1-6LYIW6A 26 Kari (in connection with other search terms) 27 Chase (in connection with other search terms) 28 Paul (in connection with other search terms) 29 Armour (in connection with other search terms) 30 physical therapist 31 relapse 32 illegal drugs 33 steroids 34 rjkarmour@aol.com 35 rebeccajwilson@comcast.net 36 lindazumwinkle@hotmail.com 37 98.203.252.75 38 JoshP Armour@aol.com 39 Joshp armour 40 206.188.36.191

1 **D. Activity on Specific Dates.**

2 All searches are restricted to the time period from November 1, 2011 through May 23,
3 2012. However, the experts will be allowed to conduct an in depth search of email and computer
4 activity logs for the dates February 16, 2012 and March 9, 2012 through April 9, 2012.

5 **E. Examination of Preservation Process.**

6 If the review of the forensic images gives rise to a dispute about the completeness of the
7 image or the process by which the technicians prepared them, the parties will meet and confer
8 about that dispute. If they are unable to resolve the dispute, they will contact the court's in-court
9 deputy clerk to discuss either filing a motion or holding a status conference to resolve the
10 dispute. If necessary, the parties will make their expert's available for depositions and provide all
11 additional documentation the parties are entitled to under FRCP 26.

12 **F. Protocol for Expert Communications.**

13 The parties have agreed to the following process for facilitating expert communication
14 and avoiding any further miscommunications: (1) All communications between our experts
15 needs to be in writing; (2) If communications are by email, counsel for all parties will need to be
16 cc'ed; (3) If oral communication is necessary and cannot be avoided, the conversations need to
17 be immediately preserved in writing, submitted to all parties, with all parties given a reasonable
18 amount of time to respond before any action is taken by the experts; and (4) Meetings between
19 the experts will need to occur with counsel for both parties present.

20 **G. Protocol for the Exchange of Computer Images**

21 Plaintiffs' expert will provide a copy or the original of the image for the Macbook Pro to
22 defendants' expert and defendants' expert will provide copies or the original of all the hard drive
23 images and emails it has created to plaintiffs' expert. The images should be shipped overnight
24 through a carrier that provides a tracking number or other method of verifying delivery. The
25 experts should ship the copies of the images within 24 hours of receiving authorization.

1 On April 15, 2013 the parties shall return all originals and copies of the computer images
2 to the originating expert. Any extension of this deadline will need to be agreed to by the parties
3 or ordered by the Court in advance of this date. Once returned, the experts shall retain copies of
4 these images until 90 Days of the resolution of this matter or otherwise ordered by the Court or
5 agreed to by the parties.

6 **III. Protective Order**

7 The computer images for the Plaintiffs' MacBook Pro will remain in the exclusive
8 custody of the Plaintiffs' expert at all times that it is not being reviewed by the Defendants'
9 expert. At the end of Defendants' examination, the original and all copies shall be returned to the
10 Plaintiffs' expert.

11 All other computers images will remain in the exclusive custody of the Defendant's
12 expert at all times that it is not being reviewed by Plaintiffs' expert. At the end of Plaintiffs'
13 examination the original and all copies shall be returned to the Defendants' expert.

14 The results and fruits of any of the above examinations are deemed protected material.
15 Possession of protected material is limited to the attorneys of record in the above captioned case
16 and their experts. The counsel and their experts may not share or review the protected material in
17 any manner with any other person, including their respective clients.

18 The data resulting from the search of the computer hard drives will be forwarded to the
19 attorney for the computer owner for review. No data will be provided to opposing counsel until
20 it has been reviewed and released by the computer owner or its representative. An index of the
21 data that was forwarded to counsel for the owner will be included with the data. This index will
22 include the file name, the date created and the file size if available. Not all data that is produced
23 will necessarily be in the form of a file so in those situations the type of data available will be
24 identified on the index (e.g., spreadsheet of Internet activity). The computer owner or its
25 representative will identify on the index the data that should be not produced and the basis for
withholding the data, and the rest will be provided to counsel requesting the data, along with the
index showing the information that was withheld.

1 Parties reserve the right to object to withholding of any data, and counsel for the parties
2 shall cooperate on procedures to resolve disputes about withheld data from the search terms
3 while preventing dissemination of the documents outside of counsel and experts. If the parties
4 cannot resolve a dispute as to the production of withheld data, then the withheld data may be
5 submitted for in camera review by the court as to its whether it must be disclosed.

6 This order does not prevent counsel from discussing the contents of documents
7 containing personal information with their respective clients or witnesses, as long as counsel
8 does not share the documents or any personal information (dates of birth, social security numbers
9 and other contact information) with the Defendants or their respective witnesses. Counsel and
10 their experts shall keep any protected material secured whenever the protected material is not
11 being used in furtherance of their work in the above captioned matter. The parties may aid their
12 counsel in the review of contents of their own email accounts only, so long as counsel takes
13 appropriate steps to prevent disclosure of any other data to the parties.

14 The results and fruits of any of the above examination may only be used in the above
15 captioned proceedings. They may not be used in any other State or Federal Court proceeding.

16 Any confidential communications between the parties and their attorneys (in this or any
17 other matter) or their spouses will not be disclosed to the parties or their counsel.

18 The parties will file all evidence obtained in their examinations with the Court under seal.
19 Any motion to seal evidence will be made without prejudice to either party.

20 **IV. Examination of Plaintiffs MacBook.**

21 The parties may examine the Plaintiffs' MacBook image for evidence that it was used to
22 access Defendants' AOL account "rjkarmour@aol.com" in April of 2012 and for reference to the
23 eBlaster program. Plaintiffs reserve their right to object to the evidence sought herein as
24 unrelated to any claims and defenses pending in this case, but agree to the search under general
25 discovery. This search will consist of the following keywords:

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MacBook Keywords	
	69.50.219.44
	10.104.8.97
	Steen
	Freshstart
	Eblaster
	spectorsoft
	AOL*
	rjkarmour@aol.com

This search shall be limited to the registry and other activity logs and the IP and internet address history of the MacBook. This search shall not include the substance of communications, private, privileged or otherwise. The results of these searches will be disclosed to both parties with all other protections noted above in section III applying.

Any other searches and examinations of the MacBook by the parties' experts must be within the protocols of section II and under the full protections applied in section III, including disclosure of all search results to Plaintiffs' counsel for review and objections prior to disclosure to Defendants' counsel.

DATED THIS 27th day of March, 2013.



The Honorable Richard A. Jones
United States District Court Judge

STIPULATED AND AGREED TO:

COSTELLO LAW FIRM

S/ Kristine A. Costello, WSBA #20934
S/Jacob Lewis, WSBA #41856
Attorney for Rebecca Wilson & Ward Wilson
Costello Law Firm, PLLC
1000 Second Ave, Suite 1780
Seattle, WA 98104
Telephone: (206) 749-5020
Fax: (206) 749-5074

OLYMPIC LAW GROUP, PLLP

/s/ Anthony David Gipe
Anthony David Gipe, WSBA No. 30491
Dennis J. McGlothlin, WSBA No. 28177

ORDER OUTLINING COMPUTER AND EMAIL
EXAMINATION PROTOCOLS AND PROTECTIONS