

The Honorable Marsha J. Pechman

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON  
AT SEATTLE**

RYAN KARNOSKI, et al.,  
*Plaintiffs*, and  
STATE OF WASHINGTON,  
*Plaintiff-Intervenor*,  
v.  
DONALD J. TRUMP, in his official capacity  
as President of the United States, et al.,  
*Defendants*.

Case No. 2:17-cv-01297-MJP  
**JOINT STIPULATION TO  
CONSOLIDATE CASES 2:17-cv-01297-  
MJP AND 2:19-cv-01206-MJP FOR ALL  
PURPOSES**  
NOTE ON MOTION CALENDAR:  
August 16, 2019

1 Plaintiffs Ryan Karnoski, Cathrine Schmid, D.L., formerly known as K.G., by his next  
2 friend and mother, Laura Garza, Lindsey Muller, Terece Lewis, Phillip Stephens, Megan  
3 Winters, Jane Doe, Human Rights Campaign, Gender Justice League, and American Military  
4 Partner Association n/k/a Modern Military Association of America (collectively, “Plaintiffs”);  
5 Plaintiff-Intervenor State of Washington; Defendants Donald J. Trump, the United States of  
6 America, Mark Esper, and the United States Department of Defense (collectively,  
7 “Defendants”), and third party Dr. Paul McHugh hereby stipulate and move the Court as follows:

8 WHEREAS, Plaintiffs filed their Complaint against Defendants on August 28, 2017 in this  
9 Court. (Dkt. # 1);

10 WHEREAS, on November 27, 2017 this Court granted Plaintiff-Intervenor’s request to  
11 join the matter (Dkt. # 101), and on December 14, 2017 Plaintiff-Intervenor filed their Complaint  
12 in this matter. (Dkt. # 104);

13 WHEREAS, on August 22, 2018 Plaintiffs served a subpoena on Dr. Paul McHugh (the  
14 “Subpoena”);

15 WHEREAS on October 3, 2018 Plaintiffs filed a motion to compel with respect to the  
16 Subpoena in the United States District Court for the District of Maryland, Case No.: 1:18-CV-  
17 3164 (the “Subpoena Dispute”) (1:18-CV-3164; Dkt. # 1);

18 WHEREAS, on July 31, 2019 the Parties in the Subpoena Dispute matter consented to  
19 transfer to this Court pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 45(f) (1:18-CV-3164; Dkt. No. 21);

20 WHEREAS, on August 1, 2019 the Clerk of Court notified counsel that the Subpoena  
21 Dispute had been transferred to this Court and was assigned to the Honorable Ricardo S.  
22 Martinez, Case No.: 2:19-cv-01206-RSM. (19-CV-1206; Dkt. # 24);

23 WHEREAS, on August 2, 2019, the Subpoena Dispute was reassigned to the Honorable  
24 Marsha J. Pechman, as related to 17-CV-1297;

25 WHEREAS, on August 9, 2019, the Parties to the Subpoena Dispute, in accordance with  
26 LCR 42(b), met and agreed to consolidate matters 17-CV-1297 and 19-CV-1206, and further  
27 agreed that no changes to the current Case Schedule (Dkt. # 344) be revised;

1 WHEREAS, Plaintiff-Intervenor is not a party to the Subpoena Dispute, but does not  
2 object to its consolidation with this matter;

3 NOW THEREFORE, pursuant to Fed R. Civ. P. 42(a) and LCR 42, Plaintiffs, Plaintiff-  
4 Intervenor, and Defendants, through their respective counsel of record, do hereby stipulate and  
5 agree, and respectfully request, that the Court enter an order that *Karnoski, et al. v. Trump, et al.*,  
6 Case No. 2:19-cv-01206-MJP be consolidated with *Karnoski, et al. v. Trump, et al.*, Case No.  
7 2:17-cv-01297-MJP for all purposes pursuant to LCR 42(a).

8  
9 SO STIPULATED

10 Respectfully submitted August 28, 2019.

11  
12 **NEWMAN DU WORS LLP**

**UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF  
JUSTICE**

13  
14 s/ Rachel Horvitz

s/ Andrew E. Carmichael

15 Derek A. Newman, WSBA No. 26967  
*dn@newmanlaw.com*

JOSEPH H. HUNT  
Assistant Attorney General  
Civil Division

16 Jason B. Sykes, WSBA No. 44369  
*jason@newmanlaw.com*

ALEXANDER K. HAAS  
Branch Director

17 Rachel Horvitz, WSBA No. 52987  
*rachel@newmanlaw.com*

ANTHONY J. COPPOLINO  
Deputy Director

18 2101 Fourth Ave., Ste. 1500  
19 Seattle, WA 98121  
(206) 274-2800

ANDREW E. CARMICHAEL, VA Bar #  
76578

20 **LAMDBA LEGAL DEFENSE AND  
21 EDUCATION FUND, INC.**

Trial Attorney  
United States Department of Justice  
Civil Division, Federal Programs Branch  
*andrew.e.carmichael@usdoj.gov*  
1100 L Street NW, Suite 12108  
Washington, DC 20530  
(202) 514-3346

22 Tara Borelli, WSBA No. 36759  
*tborelli@lambdalegal.org*

23 Camilla B. Taylor (admitted pro hac vice)

24 Peter C. Renn (admitted pro hac vice)

Sasha Buchert (admitted pro hac vice)

25 Kara Ingelhart (admitted pro hac vice)

Carl Charles (admitted pro hac vice)

26 Paul D. Castillo (admitted pro hac vice)

Counsel for Defendants

1 **OUTSERVE-SLDN, INC. N/K/A**  
2 **MODERN MILITARY ASSOCIATION**  
3 **OF AMERICA**

4 Peter Perkowski (admitted pro hac vice)

5 **KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP**

6 James F. Hurst, P.C. (admitted pro hac vice)

7 Steve Patton (admitted pro hac vice)

8 Jordan M. Heinz (admitted pro hac vice)

9 Vanessa Barsanti (admitted pro hac vice)

10 Daniel I. Siegfried (admitted pro hac vice)

11 Joseph B. Tyson (admitted pro hac vice)

12 Counsel for Plaintiffs

13 s/ Gerard Bradley

14 Gerard Bradley

15 *Gerard.V.Bradley.16@nd.edu*

16 Professor of Law

17 University of Notre Dame

18 3156 Eck Hall of Law

19 Notre Dame, IN 46556 USA

20 Counsel for Dr. Paul McHugh

**OFFICE OF THE WASHINGTON**  
**STATE ATTORNEY GENERAL**

s/ Chalia I. Stallings-Ala'ilima

Chalia I. Stallings-Ala'ilima, WSBA No.  
40694

*chalias@atg.wa.gov*

Colleen M. Melody, WSBA No. 42275

*colleenm1@atg.wa.gov*

Assistant Attorney General

Wing Luke Civil Rights Division

Office of the WA Attorney General

800 Fifth Avenue, Suite 2000

Seattle, WA 98104

(206) 464-7744

Counsel for Intervenor-Plaintiff State of  
Washington

1 **ORDER**

2 This matter comes before the Court on the Parties' Joint Stipulation to Consolidate Cases  
3 2:17-cv-01297-MJP and 2:19-cv-01206-MJP For All Purposes, and the Court having considered  
4 the Stipulation and the records and files of the case, the Court does hereby find good cause to  
5 order that the two above-captioned matters will be consolidated for all purposes before the  
6 Honorable Marsha J. Pechman, with a trial date of June 22, 2020. All future filings must be  
7 submitted in the lead case, 2:17-cv-01297-MJP.

8  
9 IT IS SO ORDERED.

10  
11 Dated this 28th day of August, 2019.

12  
13 

14 Marsha J. Pechman  
15 United States District Judge

16  
17 PRESENTED BY:

18  
19 **NEWMAN DU WORS LLP**

**UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE**

20  
21 s/ Rachel Horvitz

s/ Andrew E. Carmichael

22 Derek A. Newman, WSBA No. 26967

JOSEPH H. HUNT

23 dn@newmanlaw.com

Assistant Attorney General  
Civil Division

24 Jason B. Sykes, WSBA No. 44369

ALEXANDER K. HAAS  
Branch Director

25 jason@newmanlaw.com

26 Rachel Horvitz, WSBA No. 52987

ANTHONY J. COPPOLINO  
Deputy Director

27 rachel@newmanlaw.com

28 2101 Fourth Ave., Ste. 1500

Seattle, WA 98121

(206) 274-2800

ANDREW E. CARMICHAEL, VA Bar #  
76578

**LAMDBA LEGAL DEFENSE AND  
EDUCATION FUND, INC.**

Trial Attorney  
United States Department of Justice  
Civil Division, Federal Programs Branch

Tara Borelli, WSBA No. 36759

1 *tborelli@lambdalegal.org*  
Camilla B. Taylor (admitted pro hac vice)  
2 Peter C. Renn (admitted pro hac vice)  
Sasha Buchert (admitted pro hac vice)  
3 Kara Ingelhart (admitted pro hac vice)  
4 Carl Charles (admitted pro hac vice)  
Paul D. Castillo (admitted pro hac vice)

5  
6 **OUTSERVE-SLDN, INC. N/K/A**  
7 **MODERN MILITARY ASSOCIATION**  
8 **OF AMERICA**

Peter Perkowski (admitted pro hac vice)

9  
10 **KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP**

11 James F. Hurst, P.C. (admitted pro hac vice)  
12 Steve Patton (admitted pro hac vice)  
Jordan M. Heinz (admitted pro hac vice)  
13 Vanessa Barsanti (admitted pro hac vice)  
Daniel I. Siegfried (admitted pro hac vice)  
14 Joseph B. Tyson (admitted pro hac vice)

15 Counsel for Plaintiffs

16  
17  
18 s/ Gerard Bradley

19 Gerard Bradley  
*Gerard.V.Bradley.16@nd.edu*  
20 Professor of Law  
University of Notre Dame  
21 3156 Eck Hall of Law  
22 Notre Dame, IN 46556 USA

23 Counsel for Dr. Paul McHugh  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

*andrew.e.carmichael@usdoj.gov*  
1100 L Street NW, Suite 12108  
Washington, DC 20530  
(202) 514-3346

Counsel for Defendants  
**OFFICE OF THE WASHINGTON**  
**STATE ATTORNEY GENERAL**

s/ Chalia I. Stallings-Ala'ilima

Chalia I. Stallings-Ala'ilima, WSBA No.  
40694

*chalias@atg.wa.gov*

Colleen M. Melody, WSBA No. 42275

*colleenm1@atg.wa.gov*

Assistant Attorney General  
Wing Luke Civil Rights Division  
Office of the WA Attorney General  
800 Fifth Avenue, Suite 2000  
Seattle, WA 98104  
(206) 464-7744

Counsel for Intervenor-Plaintiff State of  
Washington

1 **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

2 The undersigned certifies under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States of  
3 America and the laws of the State of Washington that all participants in the case are registered  
4 CM/ECF users and that service of the foregoing documents will be accomplished by the  
5 CM/ECF system on August 28, 2019.

6  
7 s/ Rachel Horvitz  
8 Rachel Horvitz, WSBA No. 52987  
9 *rachel@newmanlaw.com*  
10 2101 Fourth Ave., Ste. 1500  
11 Seattle, WA 98121  
12 (206) 274-2800  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28