

THE HONORABLE JOHN C. COUGHENOUR

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON  
AT SEATTLE

In the Matter of the Application of  
LUFTHANSA TECHNIK AG, Petitioner, for  
an Order Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. 1782 to Take  
Discovery, Pursuant to the Federal Rules of  
Civil Procedure, of Respondent Panasonic  
Avionics Corporation for Use in Foreign  
Proceedings,

CASE NO. C17-1453-JCC  
PROTECTIVE ORDER

This matter comes before the Court on the parties' filing of a proposed protective order (Dkt. No. 40). Based upon the parties' stipulation, the Court ORDERS the following:

WHEREAS the disputes between these parties arise in a highly competitive industry in which constant innovation and research are necessary, that disclosure of material relating to innovation and research could cause decided competitive harm or unfair competitive advantage, and that therefore good cause exists for entry of a protective order regarding confidentiality of trade secret or nonpublic technical, commercial, financial, personal, or business information that is expected to be produced or provided in the course of discovery;

WHEREAS the applicant in this action, Lufthansa Technik AG ("Lufthansa"), recognizes that in response to its requests for discovery under 28 U.S.C. § 1782, Respondent, Panasonic Avionics Corporation ("Panasonic"), may be required to disclose such confidential or sensitive business information;

1           WHEREAS such sensitive information should be treated as confidential, but not restricted  
2 in such a way as would impede Lufthansa’s ability to use the discovered information to aid of the  
3 aforementioned German proceeding or Contemplated Proceedings;

4           NOW, THEREFORE, it is hereby ordered as follows:

5           **Definitions**

6           As used in this Protective Order, the following definitions apply.

7           1.       The terms “**Panasonic**” and “**Respondent**” refer to Panasonic Avionics  
8 Corporation.

9           2.       The terms “**Lufthansa**” and “**Petitioner**” refer to Lufthansa Technik AG.

10          3.       The terms “**AES**” and “**Intervenor**” refer to Astronics Advanced Electronic  
11 Systems Corp.

12          4.       The term “**German Proceedings**” refers to Civil Law Proceeding No. 7 O 289/10,  
13 before the Mannheim Regional Court, and any appeals therefrom.

14          5.       The term “**Contemplated Proceedings**” refers to contemplated or pending  
15 proceedings relating to the rights of Lufthansa arising out of any parts or foreign counterparts of  
16 European Patent No. EP 881 145 that have been or are being considered for filing in Germany,  
17 France, Spain, the United Kingdom and/or Japan other than the German Proceedings.

18          6.       The term “**Action**” refers to Lufthansa’s § 1782 Petition to this Court (Case No.  
19 C17-1453-JCC).

20          7.       The term “**Confidential Information**” refers to information produced by  
21 Panasonic and designated by either Panasonic or AES as “ATTORNEYS EYES ONLY” under  
22 the terms of this Protective Order.

23          8.       The term “**Privileged Information**” refers to information protected by the  
24 attorney-client privilege, the work product doctrine, or any other applicable privilege or  
25 immunity.

26           //

1 **Method of Designating Confidential Information**

2 9. Designation of Confidential Information should be made by stamping, placing, or  
3 affixing on the document in a manner which will not interfere with its legibility the phrase  
4 “ATTORNEY’S EYES ONLY.”

5 10. Information should only be designated as Confidential Information when either  
6 Panasonic or AES in good faith believes that the information contains trade secrets or nonpublic  
7 technical, commercial, financial, personal, or business information.

8 11. Except for documents produced for inspection at Panasonic’s facilities or its  
9 counsel’s offices, the designation of Confidential Information should be made prior to, or  
10 contemporaneously with, the production or disclosure of that information.

11 12. In the event that documents are produced for inspection at Panasonic’s facilities or  
12 its counsel’s offices, such documents may be produced for inspection before being marked  
13 “ATTORNEY’S EYES ONLY.” However, once specific documents have been designated for  
14 copying, any documents containing Confidential Information should then be marked  
15 “ATTORNEY’S EYES ONLY” before delivery to Lufthansa and AES.

16 13. To the extent that depositions are taken, Confidential Information disclosed during  
17 the deposition may be designated by notice, but only if it is designated as “ATTORNEY’S EYES  
18 ONLY” on the record when the deposition is taken. If a party discovers after the conclusion of a  
19 deposition that it has inadvertently failed to designate the deposition testimony as  
20 “ATTORNEY’S EYES ONLY,” it may designate the testimony as such by writing to counsel for  
21 the opposing parties within thirty (30) days after the conclusion of the deposition. Prior to the  
22 expiration of the thirty (30) day period, the parties shall treat the entire deposition testimony,  
23 transcript, and exhibits as if they had been designated as “ATTORNEY’S EYES ONLY.”

24 **Inadvertent Disclosure of Confidential Information or Privileged Information**

25 14. If Panasonic discovers after the production of a document that it has inadvertently  
26 failed to designate the document as “ATTORNEY’S EYES ONLY,” it may within thirty (30)

1 days after production give written notice to Lufthansa and AES that the document contains  
2 confidential material, whereupon (i) the Lufthansa and AES shall, to the extent possible, retrieve  
3 all copies of the inadvertently produced document from any person or persons in possession of  
4 such copies and return them to Panasonic; (ii) Panasonic will simultaneously provide copies of  
5 the same document with each page marked "ATTORNEY'S EYES ONLY," and (iii) thereafter  
6 the parties shall treat such document as "ATTORNEY'S EYES ONLY."

7 15. If AES reasonably believes that Panasonic has failed to designate information as  
8 ATTORNEYS EYES ONLY, AES shall notify Panasonic and Lufthansa of the alleged failure  
9 within 30 days of Panasonic's production of the information. Upon Lufthansa's receipt of AES's  
10 notice, both AES and Lufthansa shall destroy or return the undesignated documents and  
11 Panasonic shall provide copies of the same documents marked "ATTORNEY'S EYES ONLY."  
12 Thereafter the parties shall treat such documents as "ATTORNEY'S EYES ONLY."

13 16. If Lufthansa or AES believes that Panasonic may have inadvertently produced  
14 Privileged Information, they shall notify Panasonic's counsel of the potential inadvertent  
15 production within 5 business days and shall immediately sequester the potentially Privileged  
16 Information.

17 17. Panasonic's inadvertent production of Privileged Information shall not constitute a  
18 waiver of, and shall not otherwise prejudice any claim that such material or related material is  
19 privileged, protected as attorney work product, or is otherwise immune from discovery, provided  
20 that Panasonic notifies Lufthansa and AES in writing promptly after discovery of such inadvertent  
21 production. Such inadvertently produced documents and things and all copies thereof shall  
22 promptly be returned to Panasonic upon request. After a request for the return of the  
23 inadvertently produced documents and things is made by Panasonic, no use shall be made of such  
24 documents and things other than to challenge the propriety of the asserted privilege or immunity,  
25 nor shall they be shown or disclosed to any person who had not already been given access to them  
26 before receipt of the request to return them. No demonstration or proof of error, inadvertence,

1 excusable neglect, or absence of negligence shall be required of Panasonic in order to avail itself  
2 of the protection and provisions of this paragraph.

3 **Handling and Disclosure of Confidential Information**

4 18. No person shall disclose any Confidential Information under this Protective Order  
5 to any other person, except as follows:

6 18.1. Disclosure may be made to counsel of record in this Action, counsel in the German  
7 Proceedings, or counsel involved in the Contemplated Proceedings who have  
8 signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A), as well as  
9 employees of such counsel to whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the  
10 information for this litigation.

11 18.2. Disclosure may be made to in-house counsel of the receiving party—Dr. Nikolaus  
12 Henrich and Frank Zirn for Lufthansa and Ed Sterner for AES—provided that each  
13 individual shall have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound”  
14 (Exhibit A).

15 18.3. Disclosure may be made to court reporters engaged for depositions and those  
16 persons, if any, specifically engaged for the limited purpose of making photocopies  
17 of documents. Prior to disclosure to any such court reporter or person engaged in  
18 making photocopies of documents, such person must agree to be bound by the  
19 terms of this Protective Order.

20 18.4. Disclosure may be made to consultants, investigators, or experts (hereinafter  
21 referred to collectively as “experts”) who are engaged to assist in the preparation  
22 and trial of the German Proceedings or Contemplated Proceedings. Any such  
23 expert shall not be an employee of a party. Any such expert shall be identified in  
24 writing in a notice that is received by counsel for the producing party at least five  
25 (5) business days in advance of any disclosure. If, within five (5) business days  
26 after such notice is received, an objection is filed by Panasonic or AES in this

1 Court to such disclosure, then no such disclosure shall be made without further  
2 order of this Court. Before disclosure is made to any expert, he or she shall sign  
3 the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A) indicating (a) that  
4 he or she has read and understands this Protective Order; and (b) that he or she  
5 shall be bound by the terms of the Protective Order.

6 18.5. Disclosure may be made to deponents and their counsel during depositions to the  
7 extent there are depositions in this Action.

8 18.6. Disclosure may be made to a court in the German Proceedings or Contemplated  
9 Proceedings, provided that the party making the disclosure shall give the  
10 producing party notice at least five (5) business days in advance of such disclosure.  
11 If, within five (5) business days after such notice is received, the producing party  
12 does not file a motion with this court objecting to the disclosure and showing good  
13 cause as to why the information shall be withheld, then such disclosure shall be  
14 made without further order of this court. If this Court determines that there is good  
15 cause for keeping the documents or other information sought to be disclosed  
16 confidential in the German Proceedings or Contemplated Proceedings, then the  
17 party seeking to make the disclosure in the German Proceedings or Contemplated  
18 Proceedings may not do so unless it obtains specific authorization, in advance,  
19 from this Court to do so. In evaluating such a request, this Court will consider the  
20 extent to which additional protections (beyond those contained herein) are  
21 necessary to insure confidentiality for the documents or other information in the  
22 German Proceedings or Contemplated Proceedings.

23 18.7. Disclosure may be made to this Court, its clerks and staff by filing Confidential  
24 Information (or any substantive reference to it in any other submission) under seal  
25 in the manner consistent with this Court’s Local Rules for filing documents under  
26 seal.

1 18.8. Disclosure may be made to independent litigation support services, including  
2 document reproduction services, computer imaging services, and demonstrative  
3 exhibit services. Prior to disclosure to any such services, such services must agree  
4 to be bound by the provision of this Protective Order requiring that the documents  
5 and information be held in confidence.

6 19. Except as provided in Paragraph 18, counsel for the parties (in the German  
7 Proceedings, Contemplated Proceedings, and this litigation) must keep all Confidential  
8 Information secure within their exclusive possession. Each person to whom Confidential  
9 Information is disclosed shall be informed of the terms of this Protective Order and agree to be  
10 bound by it before disclosure to such person of any such information. Counsel for Lufthansa and  
11 AES shall provide Panasonic's counsel with copies of all signed "Acknowledgment and  
12 Agreement to Be Bound" statements within ten (10) days of their execution.

13 20. All copies, duplicates, extracts, summaries, or descriptions (hereinafter referred to  
14 collectively as "copies") of Confidential Information or any portion thereof, must be immediately  
15 affixed with the word "ATTORNEY'S EYES ONLY" if that word does not already appear.

16 21. To the extent that any transcripts of depositions, exhibits, or any other papers filed  
17 or to be filed with this Court in this litigation reveal or tend to reveal Confidential Information,  
18 these papers or any portion thereof must be filed under seal in accordance with this Court's  
19 procedures for filing under seal.

20 22. This Protective Order shall be applicable to (i) all Confidential Information,  
21 whether produced by Panasonic or any other party, non-party, or third party, pursuant to  
22 deposition notice, requests for production of documents, subpoenas, or other discovery requests,  
23 whether formal or informal, in connection with this Action, and (2) all Confidential Information  
24 provided by any party in connection with any evidentiary hearings or other proceedings  
25 conducted during the course of this Action.

26 23. Compliance with the terms of this Protective Order shall not be deemed an

1 admission that any documents are admissible in evidence and shall not constitute a waiver of  
2 objections concerning further use of the documents. Entering into, agreeing to, and/or complying  
3 with the terms of this Protective Order shall not (a) operate as an admission by any party that any  
4 document or material designated by any other party as “ATTORNEY’S EYES ONLY” contains  
5 or reflects proprietary or other confidential matter, or (b) prejudice in any way the right of any  
6 party to seek determination by the Court on notice of whether any particular document or material  
7 should be designated “ATTORNEY’S EYES ONLY.”

8         24. If another court or administrative agency subpoenas or orders production of any  
9 discovery materials that a party has obtained under the terms of this Protective Order, such party  
10 shall promptly notify the party who produced the materials of the pendency of such subpoenas or  
11 order, and shall allow the party who produced the materials a reasonable period of time to oppose  
12 or quash the subpoena or order before providing the materials to the person or entity seeking  
13 them. Compliance with any subpoena or order shall not be deemed a violation of this Protective  
14 Order absent the entry, in advance of the response date for the subpoena or order, of a  
15 supplemental protective order barring disclosure of the information, and communication of such  
16 an order to counsel for the person or entity under subpoena or order.

17 **Destruction or Return of Confidential Information**

18         25. Within thirty (30) days of the conclusion of the last of the German Proceedings  
19 and Contemplated Proceedings, including any and all appeals, all Confidential Information not  
20 received in evidence must be returned to Panasonic, or certified to have been destroyed. The  
21 certification shall be filed with the Court by the receiving party’s counsel of record in this Action.

22 **Challenging an “ATTORNEY’S EYES ONLY” designation**

23         26. The parties must make every attempt to resolve any dispute regarding confidential  
24 designations without Court involvement. Any motion regarding confidential designations or to  
25 modify this Protective Order must include a certification, in the motion or in a declaration or  
26 affidavit, that the movant has engaged in a good faith meet and confer conference with other



1 affected parties in an effort to resolve the dispute without court action. The certification must list  
2 the date, manner, and participants to the conference. A good faith effort to confer requires a face-  
3 to-face meeting or a telephone conference.

4 27. A designation of “ATTORNEY’S EYES ONLY” may be challenged by Lufthansa  
5 if the parties cannot resolve the issue without court intervention. If a challenge is made,  
6 Panasonic bears the burden of showing that the designation is appropriate. A party moving to  
7 modify this Protective Order to provide for greater restrictions on disclosure must show that such  
8 a modification is necessary to protect the movant’s interests.

9 **Miscellaneous Provisions**

10 28. In the event that any Confidential Information is submitted as evidence in the  
11 German Proceedings or Contemplated Proceedings, access will be limited to those persons  
12 identified in Paragraph 18.

13 29. This Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter for the purpose of enforcing  
14 and/or modifying, altering, and/or amending the scope of this Protective Order, which shall  
15 continue to be binding after the conclusion of this Action.

16 30. Lufthansa shall assure compliance with this Protective Order by its representatives  
17 and Lufthansa shall be responsible for any violation of this Protective Order by its counsel. The  
18 parties reserve the right to seek any and all remedies available under applicable law in the event  
19 of a violation of this Protective Order.

20  
21 Entered this 19th day of January 2018.

22  
23  
24  
25  
26  


John C. Coughenour  
UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

1 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
2 WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON

3 In the Matter of the Application of ) No. \_\_\_\_\_  
4 LUFTHANSA TECHNIK AG, Petitioner, for )  
5 an Order Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1782 to Take )  
6 Discovery, Pursuant to the Federal Rules of )  
7 Civil Procedure, of Respondent Astronics )  
8 Advanced Electronic Systems for Use in )  
9 Foreign Proceedings. )  
\_\_\_\_\_ )

9 **CONFIDENTIALITY STATEMENT**

10 UNDERTAKING OF \_\_\_\_\_

11 STATE OF \_\_\_\_\_)

12 COUNTY OF \_\_\_\_\_)

13 I, \_\_\_\_\_, being duly sworn, state that:

14 My address is \_\_\_\_\_.

15 My present employer is \_\_\_\_\_.

16 My present occupation or job description is \_\_\_\_\_.

17 I have received a copy of the protective order in this case signed by district judge

18 \_\_\_\_\_ on \_\_\_\_\_.

19 I have carefully read and understand the provisions of the protective order.

20 I will comply with all of the provisions of the protective order.

21 I will hold in confidence, and not disclose to anyone not qualified under the protective  
22 order, any Confidential Information or information derived therefrom, including words substance  
23 summaries, abstracts or indices of Confidential Information disclosed to me.

24 I shall return all materials containing Confidential Information and summaries, abstracts,  
25 and indices thereof, and copies thereof, which come into my possession, and document or things  
26

1 which I have prepared relating thereto, to counsel for the party by whom I am employed,  
2 retained, or otherwise designated as a qualified person.

3 I hereby submit to the jurisdiction of this court for the purpose of enforcement of the  
4 protective order in this case.

5 Dated: \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_  
Signature

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26