

THE HONORABLE JOHN C. COUGHENOUR

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON
AT SEATTLE

JENNY JOHNSON, individually and on
behalf of a class of persons similarly
situated, and on behalf of the Providence
Health & Service 403(b) Value Plan,

Plaintiff,

v.

PROVIDENCE HEALTH &
SERVICES, *et al.*,

Defendants.

CASE NO. C17-1779-JCC

ORDER

This matter comes before the Court on the Parties stipulated protective order (Dkt. No. 42). Pursuant to the parties' stipulation, the Court ORDERS as follows:

1. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

The Parties acknowledge that discovery in this action is likely to involve production of confidential, proprietary, or private information for which special protection may be warranted. Accordingly, the Parties hereby stipulate to and petition the Court to enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this agreement is consistent with Local Civil Rule 26(c). It does not confer blanket protection on all disclosures or responses to discovery, the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment under the applicable legal

ORDER
C17-1779-JCC
PAGE - 1

1 principles, and it does not presumptively entitle parties to file confidential information under
2 seal.

3 2. “CONFIDENTIAL” MATERIAL

4 “Confidential” material shall include any document, material, or information supplied in
5 any form, or any portion thereof, which contains confidential or proprietary business,
6 commercial, research, personal, personnel, process, product, or financial information of the
7 producing party or non-party, including, without limitation, discussions of business operations,
8 processes, and procedures; personally identifiable information such as social security numbers;
9 proprietary software or systems; proprietary edits or customizations to software; proprietary
10 product information; margin, cost, and pricing information; trade secrets; confidential research
11 and analysis; board materials, discussions, and presentations; executive or committee meeting
12 minutes, materials, discussions, and presentations; interactions with government regulatory
13 bodies; negotiation strategies; information or data relating to strategic plans; data received from a
14 non-party pursuant to a current Non-Disclosure Agreement; commercial agreements; settlement
15 negotiations; and settlement agreements; and Plaintiff’s investment balances in the Plan, the
16 account or routing numbers of any of Plaintiff’s bank or retirement accounts, her address, her
17 employment or personnel file and any other information protected under Federal Rule of Civil
18 Procedure 5.2. A designation by a party or non-party of Confidential Information shall constitute
19 a representation to the Court that such party or non-party believes in good faith that the
20 information constitutes Confidential Information. The parties and non-parties shall make a
21 good-faith effort to designate information only as needed.

22 3. SCOPE

23 The protections conferred by this agreement cover not only confidential material (as
24 defined above), but also (1) any information copied or extracted from confidential material; (2)
25 all copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations of confidential material; and (3) any testimony,
26 conversations, or presentations by parties or their counsel that might reveal confidential material.

1 However, the protections conferred by this agreement do not cover information that is in
2 the public domain or becomes part of the public domain through trial or otherwise.

3 4. ACCESS TO AND USE OF CONFIDENTIAL MATERIAL

4 4.1 Basic Principles. A receiving party may use confidential material that is disclosed
5 or produced by another party or by a non-party in connection with this case only for prosecuting,
6 defending, or attempting to settle this litigation. Confidential material may be disclosed only to
7 the categories of persons and under the conditions described in this agreement. Confidential
8 material must be stored and maintained by a receiving party at a location and in a secure manner
9 that ensures that access is limited to the persons authorized under this agreement.

10 4.2 Disclosure of “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items. Unless otherwise
11 ordered by the Court or permitted in writing by the designating party, a receiving party may
12 disclose any confidential material only to:

13 (a) the receiving party’s counsel of record in this action, as well as employees
14 of counsel to whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the information for this litigation;

15 (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including in house counsel) of the
16 receiving party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation, unless the parties
17 agree that a particular document or material produced is for Attorney’s Eyes Only and is so
18 designated;

19 (c) experts, consultants, and service providers, to whom disclosure is
20 reasonably necessary for this litigation, including settlement of same, and who have signed the
21 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

22 (d) the Court, court personnel, and court reporters and their staff;

23 (e) copy or imaging services retained by counsel to assist in the duplication of
24 confidential material, provided that counsel for the party retaining the copy or imaging service
25 instructs the service not to disclose any confidential material to third parties and to immediately
26 return all originals and copies of any confidential material;

1 (f) during their depositions, witnesses in the action to whom disclosure is
2 reasonably necessary and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound”
3 (Exhibit A), unless otherwise agreed by the designating party or ordered by the Court. Pages of
4 transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal confidential material must
5 be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted
6 under this agreement;

7 (g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a
8 custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information.

9 (h) any mediator retained by the Parties or appointed by the Court in this
10 action and employees of such mediator who are assisting in the conduct of the mediation.

11 4.3 Filing Confidential Material. Before filing confidential material or discussing or
12 referencing such material in court filings, the filing party shall confer with the designating party
13 to determine whether the designating party will remove the confidential designation, whether the
14 document can be redacted, or whether a motion to seal or stipulation and proposed order is
15 warranted. Local Civil Rule 5(g) sets forth the procedures that must be followed and the
16 standards that will be applied when a party seeks permission from the court to file material under
17 seal.

18 5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

19 5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection. Each party
20 or non-party that designates information or items for protection under this agreement must take
21 care to limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies under the appropriate
22 standards. Except with regard to depositions and/or deposition transcripts as addressed in section
23 5.2(b) *infra*, designating material on a document-by-document basis qualifies as exercising the
24 requisite reasonable care.

25 Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations that are
26 shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper purpose (*e.g.*, to

unnecessarily encumber or delay the case development process or to impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) expose the designating party to sanctions.

If it comes to a designating party's attention that information or items that it designated for protection do not qualify for protection, the designating party must promptly notify all other parties that it is withdrawing the mistaken designation.

5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in this agreement (*see, e.g.*, second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise stipulated or ordered, disclosure or discovery material that qualifies for protection under this agreement must be clearly so designated before or when the material is disclosed or produced.

(a) Information in documentary form: (*e.g.*, paper or electronic documents and deposition exhibits, but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings), the designating party must affix the word "CONFIDENTIAL" to each page that contains confidential material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the producing party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (*e.g.*, by making appropriate markings in the margins).

(b) Testimony given in deposition or in other pretrial proceedings: the parties and any participating non-parties may identify on the record, during the deposition or other pretrial proceeding, all protected testimony, without prejudice to their right to so designate other testimony after reviewing the transcript. Any party or non-party may, within twenty business days after receiving the final transcript of the deposition or other pretrial proceeding, designate portions of the transcript, or exhibits thereto, as confidential. Until that 20-business-day period has expired, all testimony shall be treated as confidential. If a party or non-party desires to protect confidential information at trial, the issue should be addressed during the pre-trial conference.

(c) Other tangible items: the producing party must affix in a prominent place on the exterior of the container or containers in which the information or item is stored the word

1 “CONFIDENTIAL.” If only a portion or portions of the information or item warrant protection,
2 the producing party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the protected portion(s).

3 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent failure to
4 designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the designating party’s
5 right to secure protection under this agreement for such material. Upon timely correction of a
6 designation, the receiving party must make reasonable efforts to ensure that the material is
7 treated in accordance with the provisions of this agreement.

8 6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

9 6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any party or non-party may challenge a designation of
10 confidentiality at any time. Unless a prompt challenge to a designating party’s confidentiality
11 designation is necessary to avoid foreseeable, substantial unfairness, unnecessary economic
12 burdens, or a significant disruption or delay of the litigation, a party does not waive its right to
13 challenge a confidentiality designation by electing not to mount a challenge promptly after the
14 original designation is disclosed.

15 6.2 Meet and Confer. The parties must make every attempt to resolve any dispute
16 regarding confidential designations without court involvement. Any motion regarding
17 confidential designations or for a protective order must include a certification, in the motion or in
18 a declaration or affidavit, that the movant has engaged in a good faith meet and confer
19 conference with other affected parties in an effort to resolve the dispute without court action. The
20 certification must list the date, manner, and participants to the conference. A good faith effort to
21 confer requires a face-to-face meeting or a telephone conference.

22 6.3 Judicial Intervention. If the parties cannot resolve a challenge without court
23 intervention, the designating party may file and serve a motion to retain confidentiality under
24 Local Civil Rule 7 (and in compliance with Local Civil Rule 5(g), if applicable). The burden of
25 persuasion in any such motion shall be on the designating party. Frivolous challenges, and those
26 made for an improper purpose (*e.g.*, to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on

other parties) may expose the challenging party to sanctions. All parties shall continue to maintain the material in question as confidential until the Court rules on the challenge.

7. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN OTHER LITIGATION

If a party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this action as “CONFIDENTIAL,” that party must:

(a) promptly notify the designating party in writing and include a copy of the subpoena or court order;

(b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena or order is subject to this agreement. Such notification shall include a copy of this agreement; and

(c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued by the designating party whose confidential material may be affected.

8. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

If a receiving party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed confidential material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this agreement, the receiving party must immediately (a) notify in writing the designating party of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the protected material, (c) inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this agreement, and (d) request that such person or persons execute the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

9. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE PROTECTED MATERIAL

When a producing party gives notice to receiving parties that certain inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection, the obligations of the

receiving parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery order or agreement that provides for production without prior privilege review. The parties agree to the entry of a non-waiver order under Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d) as set forth herein.

10. NON TERMINATION AND RETURN OF DOCUMENTS

Within 60 days after the termination of this action, including all appeals, each receiving party must destroy or return all confidential material to the producing party, including all copies, extracts and summaries thereof. If a Party chooses to destroy confidential material, then the Party's counsel shall execute a certificate of compliance and deliver the same to counsel for the producing Party within the 60 days discussed above.

Notwithstanding this provision, counsel are entitled to retain and sequester one archival copy of all documents filed with the court, trial, deposition, and hearing transcripts, correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert work product, even if such materials contain confidential material.

The confidentiality obligations imposed by this agreement shall remain in effect until a designating party agrees otherwise in writing or a court orders otherwise.

IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.

DATED: May 31, 2018

s/ Mark K. Gyandoh

Mark K. Gyandoh (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Attorney for Plaintiff

DATED: May 31, 2018

s/ Cliff Cantor

Cliff Cantor, WSBA # 17893
Attorney for Plaintiff

DATED: May 31, 2018

s/ Meghan VerGow

Meaghan VerGow (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Attorney for Defendants

1 PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO ORDERED

2 IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that pursuant to Fed. R. Evid. 502(d), the production of any
3 documents in this proceeding shall not, for the purposes of this proceeding or any other
4 proceeding in any other court, constitute a waiver by the producing party of any privilege
5 applicable to those documents, including the attorney-client privilege, attorney work-product
6 protection, or any other privilege or protection recognized by law.

7 DATED this 4th day of June 2018.

8
9
10 

11 John C. Coughenour
12 UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26

EXHIBIT A

ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

I, _____ [print or type full name], of
_____ [print or type full address], declare under penalty of
perjury that I have read in its entirety and understand the Stipulated Protective Order that was
issued by the United States District Court for the Western District of Washington on [date] in the
case of *Jenny Johnson v. Providence Health & Human Services, et al.*, C17-1779-JCC (W.D.
Wash. 2017). I agree to comply with and to be bound by all the terms of this Stipulated
Protective Order and I understand and acknowledge that failure to so comply could expose me to
sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt. I solemnly promise that I will not disclose
in any manner any information or item that is subject to this Stipulated Protective Order to any
person or entity except in strict compliance with the provisions of this Order.

I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court for the
Western District of Washington for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this Stipulated
Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after termination of this action.

Date: _____

City and State where sworn and signed: _____

Printed name: _____

Signature: _____