Dockets.Justia.com

Doc. 164

Order entered in this case. Defendant takes no position concerning the confidentiality of Exhibits 2 and 3 and any references thereto in Plaintiff's Motion.

Defendant's position is that the designation of Exhibits 11, 16, 17, 18, 19, 23, 26, 27, 28, 29, 30, 33, 35, 37, 68, 70, 79, 82, 83, and 88, and references thereto in Plaintiff's Motion, should be maintained to protect the legitimate private interests of Minagrex and third-parties, to which it owes an obligation of confidentiality, in accordance with the Stipulated Protective Order [Dkt. 16]. Specifically, Minagrex believes that the Exhibits referenced satisfy, individually and collectively, the requirements set forth in \$\mathbb{P}2.2\$ (a), (c), (d), (e), (f), and \$\mathbb{P}2.3\$ of the Stipulated Protective Order [Dkt. 16]. Said Exhibits contain confidential sales information, trade secrets, confidential and sales related communications with third-parties to which Minagrex believes it owes a duty of confidentiality, agreements with third-parties that are not otherwise, supplier lists, information related to the ownership or control of a non-public company, and other previously non-disclosed sales and financial information worthy of the Court's protection as specified in the Stipulated Protective Order [Dkt. 16].

Plaintiff's position is that information in Plaintiff's Motion from Exhibits 2 and 3 should be filed under seal to protect the legitimate private interests of Plaintiff in accordance with the Protective Order issued in this case (Dkt. #16). Exhibits 2 and 3 contain confidential proprietary, and private information that Plaintiff designated as Confidential pursuant to and consistent with the Protective Order entered in this case, because it contains previously nondisclosed information relating to the ownership and control of Plaintiff, a non-public company. Plaintiff has a legitimate business interest in keeping information relating to its ownership and control private, and thus requires that this document be filed under seal. *See* Dkt. #16 at p. 2 ¶ 2.2(a) (stating that confidential information includes "previously nondisclosed material relating to ownership or control of any non-public entity).

After review of each referenced Exhibit, ¶4.4 of the Stipulated Protective Order and Local Rule 5(g), Minagrex and Plaintiff both believe that a less restrictive alternative is not sufficient to

Case 2:19-cv-01697-RSM Document 164 Filed 09/16/21 Page 3 of 7

1	protect the confidential information referenced above because redaction of the same would		
2	substantively frustrate the purpose of its admission.		
3	Plaintiff is filing publicly a redacted Motion concurrently herewith.		
4			
5	Dated: August 18, 2021	By: /s/ Rachel S. Black	
6		Rachel S. Black, WSBA #32204 <u>rblack@susmangodfrey.com</u>	
7		Alexander W. Aiken (<i>Pro Hac Vice</i>) <u>aaiken@susmangodfrey.com</u>	
8		Benjamin Manne, WSBA # 54537 bmanne@susmangodfrey.com	
9		SUSMAN GODFREY L.L.P. 1201 Third Avenue, Suite 3800	
10		Seattle, WA 98101 Phone: (206) 516-3880	
11		Fax: (206) 516-3883	
12		Chelsea V. Samuels (pro hac vice pending) csamuels@susmangodfrey.com	
13		SUSMAN GODFREY L.L.P. 1900 Avenue of the Stars, Suite 1400	
14		Los Angeles, CA 90067 Phone: (310) 789-3100	
15		Attorneys for Cosmos Granite (West) LLC	
16			
17	Dated: August 18, 2021	By: <u>/s/ Betsy A. Gillaspy</u>	
18		Betsy A. Gillaspy, WSBA#21340 bgillaspy@gillaspyrhode.com	
19		Chelsey Thorne, WSBA #49740	
20		<pre>cthorne@gillaspyrhode.com GILLASPY & RHODE, PLLC</pre>	
21		821 Kirkland Avenue, Suite 200 Kirkland, WA 98033	
		Phone: (425) 646-2956	
22		Mark L. Hill (<i>Pro Hac Vice</i>)	
23		Texas State Bar # 24034868	
24		mark.hill@solidcounsel.com Walker Steven Young (<i>Pro Hac Vice</i>)	
25		Texas State Bar # 24102676	
26		walker.young@solidcounsel.com SCHEEF & STONE, LLP	
27		2600 Network Boulevard, Suite 400	
	STIPULATED MOTION TO SEAL	SUSMAN GODFREY L.L.P.	

1201 Third Avenue, Suite 3800

Tel: (206) 516-3880; Fax: (206) 516-3883

Seattle, WA 98101-3000

PLAINTIFF'S MOTION FOR

Case No. 2:19-cv-01697-RSM

PARTIAL SUMMARY JUDGMENT - 3

1	Frisco, TX 75034 Phone: (214) 472-2126
2	
3	Attorneys for Minagrex Corporation d/b/a MGX Stone
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	

Case 2:19-cv-01697-RSM Document 164 Filed 09/16/21 Page 4 of 7

STIPULATED MOTION TO SEAL PLAINTIFF'S MOTION FOR PARTIAL SUMMARY JUDGMENT - 4 Case No. 2:19-cv-01697-RSM

1 2

STIPULATED MOTION TO SEAL PLAINTIFF'S MOTION FOR PARTIAL SUMMARY JUDGMENT - 5 Case No. 2:19-cv-01697-RSM

CERTIFICATE OF CONFERENCE

Counsel for Plaintiff conferred with counsel for Defendant in a telephonic meet and confer on August 18, 2021 (Chelsea Samuels and Walker Young participated), and counsel agreed that, per Minagrex's and Plaintiff's representations concerning the confidentiality of the documents at issue, a Stipulated Motion Seal was proper to protect the confidential information, and that there was no alternative to filing under seal.

<u>/s/ Rachel S. Black</u> Rachel S. Black

ORDER Based upon the foregoing and for good cause shown, the Court ORDERS that the Stipulated Motion to Seal is GRANTED. DATED this 16th day of September, 2021. RICARDO S. MARTINEZ CHIEF UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

STIPULATED MOTION TO SEAL PLAINTIFF'S MOTION FOR PARTIAL SUMMARY JUDGMENT- 6 Case No. 2:19-cv-01697-RSM

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE I hereby certify that on August 18, 2021, I electronically filed the foregoing with the Clerk of the Court using the CM/ECF system, which will send notification of such filing to all counsel of record. /s/ Rachel S. Black Rachel S. Black Hon. Ricardo S. Martinez

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE - *1* Case No. 2:19-cv-01697-RSM