

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON  
9 AT TACOMA

10  
11 JOSE MORALES-CARRANZA,

12 Petitioner,

13 v.

14 JEFFERSON B. SESSIONS, U.S.  
Attorney General,

15 Respondent.

CASE NO. 17-5204 RJB

ORDER GRANTING  
PETITIONER'S MOTION TO  
DISMISS AND DENYING,  
WITHOUT PREJUDICE,  
RESPONDENT'S MOTION

16 This matter comes before the Court on the Petitioner's Notice of Voluntary Dismissal  
17 (Dkt. 13) and Respondent's Motion for Court to Enter Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law  
18 (Dkt. 14). The Court has considered the pleadings filed regarding the notice and motion and the  
19 remaining file.

20 **I. FACTS**

21 On March 15, 2017, this case was transferred from the Ninth Circuit Court of Appeals,  
22 pursuant to 8 U.S.C. § 1252(b)(5)(B), for the limited purpose of conducting a de novo review of  
23 Petitioner's citizenship claim. Dkt. 1. On May 1, 2017, Petitioner filed a Notice of Voluntary  
24

1 Dismissal with the Ninth Circuit Court of Appeals, voluntarily withdrawing his Petition for  
2 Review because his primary witnesses are no longer able to testify on his behalf. Dkt. 13-1. The  
3 Ninth Circuit construed Petitioner’s notice as a motion, granted the motion, and dismissed the  
4 petition that day. Dkt. 13-2.

5 Also on May 1, 2017, Petitioner filed the pending Notice of Voluntary Dismissal with  
6 this Court, and attached the Order of Dismissal of the Ninth Circuit. Dkt. 13. This notice should  
7 be construed as a motion for voluntary dismissal under Fed. R. Civ. P. 41 (a)(2). A little later on  
8 May 1, 2017, Respondent filed a Motion for Court to Enter Findings of Fact and Conclusions of  
9 Law. Dkt. 14. Respondent improperly noted the motion for May 1, 2017. *Id.* The  
10 Respondent’s motion was renoted by minute order and the parties were asked to address this  
11 Court’s jurisdiction now that the underlying petition has been dismissed by the Ninth Circuit  
12 Court of Appeals. Dkt. 15.

## 13 **II. DISCUSSION**

14 Pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 41 (a)(2), “an action may be dismissed at a Plaintiff’s request only  
15 by court order, on terms that the court considers proper.” A motion for voluntary dismissal  
16 under Rule 41(a)(2) should be granted “unless a defendant can show that it will suffer some plain  
17 legal prejudice as a result.” *Smith v. Lenches*, 263 F.3d 972, 975 (9th Cir. 2001).

18 Petitioner’s motion for voluntary dismissal (Dkt. 13) should be granted. Respondent has  
19 failed to show that he will suffer “plain legal prejudice” if this petition is dismissed. Although  
20 Respondent argues that he has expended time and resources in an effort to defend against  
21 Petitioner’s claim, in the Ninth Circuit, “legal prejudice” means “prejudice to some legal interest,  
22 some legal claim, some legal argument.” *Smith*, at 976. Respondent makes no such showing.  
23 This case should be dismissed without prejudice.

1 Moreover, the Ninth Circuit Court of Appeals has dismissed the underlying petition. Dkt.  
2 13-2. Respondent fails to show that this Court has jurisdiction over this case after the Ninth  
3 Circuit dismissed the underlying petition. Respondent's Motion for Court to Enter Findings of  
4 Fact and Conclusions of Law (Dkt. 14) should be denied without prejudice.

5 The case should be dismissed without prejudice and closed.

6 **III. ORDER**

- 7
- 8 • Petitioner's Notice of Voluntary Dismissal (Dkt. 13), construed as a motion for  
voluntary dismissal (Dkt. 13) **IS GRANTED**; and
  - 9 • Respondent's Motion for Court to Enter Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law  
10 (Dkt. 14) **IS DENIED WITHOUT PREJUDICE**; and
  - 11 • This case **IS DISMISSED WITHOUT PREJUDICE AND CLOSED**.

12 The Clerk is directed to send uncertified copies of this Order to all counsel of record and  
13 to any party appearing pro se at said party's last known address.

14 Dated this 22<sup>nd</sup> day of May, 2017.

15  
16 

17 ROBERT J. BRYAN  
18 United States District Judge  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24