

**U.S. District Court  
Western District of Wisconsin (Madison)  
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 3:18-cv-00365-wmc**

Crista, Jill et al v. Wisconsin Physicians Service Insurance Corporation et al  
Assigned to: District Judge William M. Conley  
Referred to: Magistrate Judge Stephen L. Crocker  
Cause: 29:1132 E.R.I.S.A. - Employee Benefits

Date Filed: 05/16/2018  
Date Terminated: 08/10/2021  
Jury Demand: None  
Nature of Suit: 791 Labor: E.R.I.S.A.  
Jurisdiction: Federal Question

**Plaintiff**

**Jill Crista**

represented by **Charles J. Crueger**  
Crueger Dickinson LLC  
4532 N. Oakland Ave.  
Whitefish Bay, WI 53211  
414.210.3900  
Email: [cjc@cruegerdickinson.com](mailto:cjc@cruegerdickinson.com)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Erin K. Dickinson**  
Crueger Dickinson LLC  
4532 N. Oakland Ave.  
Whitefish Bay, WI 53211  
414.210.3767  
Email: [ekd@cruegerdickinson.com](mailto:ekd@cruegerdickinson.com)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Krista Kay Baisch**  
Crueger Dickinson LLC  
4532 N. Oakland Ave.  
Whitefish Bay, WI 53211  
414-210-4367  
Email: [kkb@cruegerdickinson.com](mailto:kkb@cruegerdickinson.com)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Benjamin A. Kaplan**  
Michael Best & Friedrich, LLP  
100 East Wisconsin Avenue  
Suite 3300  
Milwaukee, WI 53202  
414-271-6560  
Fax: 414-277-0656  
Email: [bak@cruegerdickinson.com](mailto:bak@cruegerdickinson.com)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Plaintiff****Torin Hignell**

represented by **Charles J. Crueger**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Benjamin A. Kaplan**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Plaintiff****Kaelan Hignell**

represented by **Charles J. Crueger**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Benjamin A. Kaplan**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

V.

**Defendant****Wisconsin Physicians Service Insurance Corporation**

represented by **Todd G. Smith**  
Godfrey & Kahn S.C.  
One East Main Street  
Suite 500  
P.O. Box 2719  
Madison, WI 53701-2719  
608-257-3911x2653  
Email: tsmith@gklaw.com  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Adam Reed Prinsen**  
Godfrey & Kahn  
One East Main Street  
Ste. 500  
Madison, WI 53701  
920-318-6021  
Fax: 608-257-0609  
Email: aprinsen@gklaw.com  
*TERMINATED: 09/09/2019*

**Defendant****Aspirus Arise Health Plan of Wisconsin, Inc.***TERMINATED: 06/20/2018*

<b>Date Filed</b>	<b>#</b>	<b>Docket Text</b>
05/16/2018	<a href="#">1</a>	COMPLAINT against All Defendants, ( Filing fee \$ 400 receipt number 0758-2247675.), filed by Jill Crista, (Attachments: # <a href="#">1</a> JS-44 Civil Cover Sheet, # <a href="#">2</a> Summons - WPS, # <a href="#">3</a> Summons - Aspirus) (Crueger, Charles) Modified on 5/17/2018. (lak) (Entered: 05/16/2018)
05/17/2018		Case randomly assigned to District Judge William M. Conley and Magistrate Judge Stephen L. Crocker. (jat) (Entered: 05/17/2018)
05/17/2018		Standard attachments for Judge William M. Conley required to be served on all parties with summons or waiver of service: <a href="#">NORTC</a> , <a href="#">Corporate Disclosure Statement</a> . (jat) (Entered: 05/17/2018)
05/17/2018	<a href="#">2</a>	Summons Issued as to Aspirus Arise Health Plan of Wisconsin, Inc., Wisconsin Physicians Service Insurance Corporation. (jat) (Entered: 05/17/2018)
06/14/2018	<a href="#">3</a>	Affidavit of Service by Plaintiff. Wisconsin Physicians Service Insurance Corporation served on 6/8/2018, answer due 6/29/2018. (Baisch, Krista) (Entered: 06/14/2018)
06/14/2018	<a href="#">4</a>	Affidavit of Service by Plaintiff. Aspirus Arise Health Plan of Wisconsin, Inc. served on 6/5/2018, answer due 6/26/2018. (Baisch, Krista) (Entered: 06/14/2018)
06/20/2018	<a href="#">5</a>	Stipulation for Extension of Time to Plead in Response to Complaint by Defendant Wisconsin Physicians Service Insurance Corporation. (Smith, Todd) Modified on 6/20/2018. (lak) (Entered: 06/20/2018)
06/20/2018	<a href="#">6</a>	Notice of Voluntary Dismissal by Plaintiff Jill Crista. (Baisch, Krista) (Entered: 06/20/2018)
06/20/2018	7	<b>** TEXT ONLY ORDER **</b> ORDER accepting and granting <a href="#">5</a> Stipulation for extension of time to plead in response to complaint. Signed by Magistrate Judge Stephen L. Crocker on 6/20/18. (jat) (Entered: 06/20/2018)
06/20/2018		Reset Deadlines: Wisconsin Physicians Service Insurance Corporation answer due 7/20/2018. (jat) (Entered: 06/20/2018)
06/20/2018		Party Aspirus Arise Health Plan of Wisconsin, Inc. is terminated pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 15(a) without further order of the court. (jat) (Entered: 06/20/2018)
07/19/2018	<a href="#">8</a>	ANSWER by Defendant Wisconsin Physicians Service Insurance Corporation. (Smith, Todd) (Entered: 07/19/2018)
07/19/2018	<a href="#">9</a>	Corporate Disclosure Statement by Defendant Wisconsin Physicians Service Insurance Corporation. (Smith, Todd) (Entered: 07/19/2018)
07/19/2018		Set Telephone Conference: Telephone Pretrial Conference set for 8/16/2018 at 02:00 PM before Magistrate Judge Stephen L. Crocker. Counsel for Plaintiff responsible for setting up the call to chambers at (608) 264-5153. [ <a href="#">Standing Order Governing Preliminary Pretrial Conference</a> attached] (jat) (Entered: 07/19/2018)
08/10/2018	<a href="#">10</a>	Joint Preliminary Pretrial Conference Report by Defendant Wisconsin Physicians Service Insurance Corporation. (Smith, Todd) (Entered: 08/10/2018)

08/16/2018		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Magistrate Judge Stephen L. Crocker: Telephone Preliminary Pretrial Conference held on 8/16/2018 [:15] (cak) (Entered: 08/16/2018)
08/17/2018	<a href="#">11</a>	Pretrial Conference Order - <a href="#">Preliminary Pretrial Packet in cases assigned to District Judge William M. Conley</a> attached. Amendments to Pleadings due 9/7/2018. Dispositive Motions due 11/9/2018. Settlement Letters due 4/26/2019. Motions in Limine due 5/3/2019. Response to Motion due 5/17/2019. Final Pretrial Conference set for 5/28/2019 at 04:00 PM. Court Trial set for 6/10/2019 at 09:00 AM. Signed by Magistrate Judge Stephen L. Crocker on 8/17/18. (jat) (Entered: 08/17/2018)
09/06/2018	<a href="#">12</a>	AMENDED COMPLAINT against Wisconsin Physicians Service Insurance Corporation, filed by All Plaintiffs, (Attachments: # <a href="#">1</a> Exhibit A - Group Master Policy) (Crueger, Charles) Modified on 9/6/2018. (lak) (Entered: 09/06/2018)
09/20/2018	<a href="#">13</a>	ANSWER to Amended Complaint by Defendant Wisconsin Physicians Service Insurance Corporation. (Smith, Todd) (Entered: 09/20/2018)
10/22/2018	<a href="#">14</a>	Unopposed Motion to Seal Document by Plaintiffs Jill Crista, Kaelan Hignell, Torin Hignell. Motions referred to Magistrate Judge Stephen L. Crocker. (Crueger, Charles) (Entered: 10/22/2018)
10/22/2018	<a href="#">15</a>	Administrative Record from Defendant. (Sealed Document) (Attachments: # <a href="#">1</a> Admin Record - WPS505-1008, # <a href="#">2</a> Admin Record - WPS1009-1516, # <a href="#">3</a> Admin Record - WPS1517-2014) (Crueger, Charles) (Entered: 10/22/2018)
10/22/2018	<a href="#">16</a>	<b>MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT</b> by Plaintiffs Jill Crista, Kaelan Hignell, Torin Hignell. Brief in Opposition due 11/13/2018. Brief in Reply due 11/23/2018. (Crueger, Charles) (Entered: 10/22/2018)
10/22/2018	<a href="#">17</a>	Brief in Support of <a href="#">16</a> Motion for Summary Judgment by Plaintiffs Jill Crista, Kaelan Hignell, Torin Hignell. (Crueger, Charles) (Entered: 10/22/2018)
10/22/2018	<a href="#">18</a>	Proposed Findings of Fact filed by Plaintiffs Jill Crista, Kaelan Hignell, Torin Hignell re: <a href="#">16</a> Motion for Summary Judgment. (Crueger, Charles) (Entered: 10/22/2018)
10/23/2018		Reset Deadlines as to <a href="#">16</a> MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT. Brief in Opposition due 11/19/2018. Brief in Reply due 12/3/2018. (See Pretrial Conference Order <a href="#">11</a> ) (jat) (Entered: 10/23/2018)
10/23/2018	19	<b>** TEXT ONLY ORDER **</b> ORDER granting <a href="#">14</a> Unopposed Motion to Seal Administrative Record. Signed by Magistrate Judge Stephen L. Crocker on 10/23/18. (jat) (Entered: 10/23/2018)
11/09/2018	<a href="#">20</a>	Notice of Appearance filed by Adam Reed Prinsen for Defendant Wisconsin Physicians Service Insurance Corporation. (Prinsen, Adam) (Entered: 11/09/2018)
11/09/2018	<a href="#">21</a>	<b>MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT</b> by Defendant Wisconsin Physicians Service Insurance Corporation. Brief in Opposition due 11/30/2018. Brief in Reply due 12/10/2018. (Smith, Todd) (Entered: 11/09/2018)
11/09/2018	<a href="#">22</a>	Brief in Support of <a href="#">21</a> Motion for Summary Judgment by Defendant Wisconsin Physicians Service Insurance Corporation. (Smith, Todd) (Entered: 11/09/2018)

11/09/2018	<a href="#">23</a>	Proposed Findings of Fact filed by Defendant Wisconsin Physicians Service Insurance Corporation re: <a href="#">21</a> Motion for Summary Judgment. (Smith, Todd) (Entered: 11/09/2018)
11/13/2018		Reset Deadlines as to <a href="#">21</a> MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT. Brief in Opposition due 12/7/2018. Brief in Reply due 12/21/2018. (See Pretrial Conference Order <a href="#">11</a> ). (jat) (Entered: 11/13/2018)
11/13/2018		Reset Deadlines as to <a href="#">16</a> MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT. Brief in Opposition due 11/19/2018. Brief in Reply due 12/3/2018. (See Pretrial Conference Order <a href="#">11</a> ). (jat) (Entered: 11/13/2018)
11/13/2018	<a href="#">24</a>	Notice by Defendant Wisconsin Physicians Service Insurance Corporation of <i>Filing Flash Drive Under Seal</i> . (Smith, Todd) Modified on 11/13/2018. (lak) (Entered: 11/13/2018)
11/13/2018	<a href="#">25</a>	Notice of Appearance filed by Benjamin A. Kaplan for Plaintiffs Jill Crista, Kaelan Hignell, Torin Hignell. (Kaplan, Benjamin) (Entered: 11/13/2018)
11/19/2018	<a href="#">26</a>	Brief in Opposition by Defendant Wisconsin Physicians Service Insurance Corporation re: <a href="#">16</a> Motion for Summary Judgment filed by Kaelan Hignell, Torin Hignell, Jill Crista. (Smith, Todd) (Entered: 11/19/2018)
11/19/2018	<a href="#">27</a>	Response to Proposed Findings of Fact filed by Defendant Wisconsin Physicians Service Insurance Corporation re: <a href="#">16</a> Motion for Summary Judgment. (Smith, Todd) (Entered: 11/19/2018)
12/03/2018	<a href="#">28</a>	Motion to Strike <a href="#">24</a> Notice of Filing Flash Drive Under Seal, by Plaintiffs Jill Crista, Kaelan Hignell, Torin Hignell. Brief in Opposition due 12/17/2018. Brief in Reply due 12/24/2018. (Crueger, Charles) Modified on 12/4/2018. (lak) (Entered: 12/03/2018)
12/03/2018	<a href="#">29</a>	Declaration of Benjamin A. Kaplan filed by Plaintiffs Jill Crista, Kaelan Hignell, Torin Hignell re: <a href="#">28</a> Motion to Strike, (Attachments: # <a href="#">1</a> Exhibit 1 - Discovery Request, # <a href="#">2</a> Exhibit 2 - Email) (Crueger, Charles) (Entered: 12/03/2018)
12/03/2018	<a href="#">30</a>	Brief in Reply by Plaintiffs Jill Crista, Kaelan Hignell, Torin Hignell in Support of <a href="#">16</a> Motion for Summary Judgment. (Crueger, Charles) (Entered: 12/03/2018)
12/05/2018	<a href="#">31</a>	Disregard. Modified on 12/6/2018. (lak) (Entered: 12/05/2018)
12/05/2018	<a href="#">32</a>	Motion for Extension of Time by Defendant Wisconsin Physicians Service Insurance Corporation. Motions referred to Magistrate Judge Stephen L. Crocker. Response due 12/12/2018. (Smith, Todd) (Entered: 12/05/2018)
12/05/2018	<a href="#">33</a>	Response Stating No Opposition by Plaintiffs Jill Crista, Kaelan Hignell, Torin Hignell re: <a href="#">32</a> MOTION for Extension of Time filed by Wisconsin Physicians Service Insurance Corporation. (Kaplan, Benjamin) (Entered: 12/05/2018)
12/06/2018	34	** TEXT ONLY ORDER ** Defendant's request to extend its response deadline <a href="#">32</a> is GRANTED. The new deadline is December 21, 2018. Plaintiff's reply deadline is extended to January 2, 2019. (jat) (Entered: 12/06/2018)

12/07/2018	<a href="#">35</a>	Brief in Opposition by Plaintiffs Jill Crista, Kaelan Hignell, Torin Hignell re: <a href="#">21</a> Motion for Summary Judgment filed by Wisconsin Physicians Service Insurance Corporation. (Kaplan, Benjamin) (Entered: 12/07/2018)
12/07/2018	<a href="#">36</a>	Response to Proposed Findings of Fact filed by Plaintiffs Jill Crista, Kaelan Hignell, Torin Hignell re: <a href="#">21</a> Motion for Summary Judgment. (Kaplan, Benjamin) (Entered: 12/07/2018)
12/21/2018	<a href="#">37</a>	Brief in Reply by Defendant Wisconsin Physicians Service Insurance Corporation in Support of <a href="#">21</a> Motion for Summary Judgment. (Smith, Todd) (Entered: 12/21/2018)
12/21/2018	<a href="#">38</a>	Reply in Support of Proposed Findings of Fact filed by Defendant Wisconsin Physicians Service Insurance Corporation re: <a href="#">21</a> Motion for Summary Judgment. (Smith, Todd) (Entered: 12/21/2018)
12/21/2018	<a href="#">39</a>	Brief in Opposition by Defendant Wisconsin Physicians Service Insurance Corporation re: <a href="#">28</a> Motion to Strike filed by Kaelan Hignell, Torin Hignell, Jill Crista. (Smith, Todd) (Entered: 12/21/2018)
12/31/2018	<a href="#">40</a>	Brief in Reply by Plaintiffs Jill Crista, Kaelan Hignell, Torin Hignell in Support of <a href="#">28</a> Motion to Strike. (Crueger, Charles) (Entered: 12/31/2018)
04/16/2019	<a href="#">41</a>	Joint Motion to Amend Case Schedule by Plaintiffs Jill Crista, Kaelan Hignell, Torin Hignell. (Kaplan, Benjamin) Modified on 4/16/2019. (lak) (Entered: 04/16/2019)
04/17/2019	42	** TEXT ONLY ORDER ** The parties' joint request to amend the schedule <a href="#">41</a> is granted. All dates and deadlines are struck except for the June 10, 2019 bench trial. Signed by Magistrate Judge Stephen L. Crocker on 4/17/19. (jat) (Entered: 04/17/2019)
06/03/2019	<a href="#">43</a>	Joint Motion for Scheduling Clarification by Plaintiffs Jill Crista, Kaelan Hignell, Torin Hignell. Response due 6/10/2019. (Kaplan, Benjamin) (Entered: 06/03/2019)
06/03/2019	44	** TEXT ONLY ORDER ** The court is in receipt of a joint motion for clarification as to the June 10, 2019, trial date. (Dkt. # <a href="#">43</a> .) The motion is GRANTED, and the trial date is STRICKEN. The court will endeavor to issue a decision on the parties' cross-motions for summary judgment shortly. Signed by District Judge William M. Conley on 6/3/2019. (jls) (Entered: 06/03/2019)
09/06/2019	<a href="#">45</a>	Notice of Withdrawal of Counsel by Adam Reed Prinsen re: Defendant Wisconsin Physicians Service Insurance Corporation. (Prinsen, Adam) (Entered: 09/06/2019)
08/10/2021	<a href="#">46</a>	ORDER granting <a href="#">28</a> Motion to Strike <a href="#">24</a> Notice of Filing Flash Drive Under Seal; denying <a href="#">16</a> Motion for Summary Judgment; granting <a href="#">21</a> Motion for Summary Judgment. Signed by District Judge William M. Conley on 8/10/2021. (rks) (Entered: 08/10/2021)
08/10/2021	<a href="#">47</a>	JUDGMENT entered in favor of Defendant Wisconsin Physicians Service Insurance Corporation dismissing the case. (rks) (Entered: 08/10/2021)
09/07/2021	<a href="#">48</a>	NOTICE OF APPEAL by Plaintiffs Jill Crista, Kaelan Hignell, Torin Hignell as to <a href="#">47</a> Judgment, <a href="#">46</a> Order on Motion to Strike, Order on Motion for Summary Judgment,. Filing fee of \$ 505, receipt number 0758-2932166 paid. No Docketing Statement filed. (Crueger, Charles) (Entered: 09/07/2021)
09/07/2021	<a href="#">49</a>	Appeal Information Packet. (lak) (Entered: 09/07/2021)

