Electronically Filed Supreme Court SCWC-29491 08-OCT-2012 02:12 PM

NO. SCWC-29491

IN THE SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF HAWAI'I

CIVIL NO. 05-1-0947

LON WILLIAMS, Individually and as Personal Representative of the ESTATE OF ALACIA WILLIAMS, Deceased,

Petitioner/Plaintiff-Appellant,

VS.

MARC HENDERSON and STATE OF HAWAI'I, Respondents/Defendants-Appellees,

and

LORRIE ANN MONIZ and CITY AND COUNTY OF HONOLULU, Defendants, and

STATE OF HAWAI'I, Defendant/Third-Party Plaintiff-Appellee, vs.

KARIN R. WILLIAMS; CITY AND COUNTY OF HONOLULU; and GIRL SCOUT COUNCIL OF HAWAI'I, Third-Party Defendants-Appellees.

CIVIL NO. 05-1-0846

ALAN GOTO, Individually and as Personal Representative of the ESTATE OF RYAN GOTO, Deceased; DAVID BEGA; and PAUL JAVIER, Petitioners/Plaintiffs-Appellants,

VS.

MARC HENDERSON; KARIN R. WILLIAMS; GIRL SCOUT COUNCIL OF HAWAI'I; STATE OF HAWAI'I, Respondents/Defendants-Appellees,

and

LORRIE ANN MONIZ, Defendant,

and

STATE OF HAWAI'I, Third-Party Plaintiff-Appellee,

VS.

CITY AND COUNTY OF HONOLULU, Third-Party Defendant-Appellee.

CIVIL NO. 05-1-1045

KARIN WILLIAMS, Petitioner/Plaintiff-Appellant,

VS.

MARC HENDERSON; STATE OF HAWAI'I, Respondents/Defendants-Appellees,

and

LORRIE ANN MONIZ, Defendant,

and

STATE OF HAWAI'I, Third-Party Plaintiff-Appellee,

CITY AND COUNTY OF HONOLULU, Third-Party Defendant-Appellee.

CIVIL NO. 05-1-0883

GEORGIE-ANN GOTO, Individually and as Guardian of the Property of BOWEN GOTO, a minor, Petitioner/Plaintiff-Appellant,

MARC HENDERSON; KARIN R. WILLIAMS; GIRL SCOUT COUNCIL OF HAWAI'I; STATE OF HAWAI'I, Respondents/Defendants-Appellees,

and

STATE OF HAWAI'I, Cross-Plaintiff,

VS.

CITY AND COUNTY OF HONOLULU, Cross-Defendant.

CERTIORARI TO THE INTERMEDIATE COURT OF APPEALS (ICA NO. 29491; CIV. NOS. 05-1-0947, 05-1-0846, 05-1-1045 and 05-1-0883)

ORDER REJECTING APPLICATION FOR WRIT OF CERTIORARI
(By: Nakayama, Acoba, and Pollack, JJ., and Circuit
Judge Castagnetti, in place of McKenna, J., recused,
with Recktenwald, C.J., dissenting)

The Application for Writ of Certiorari filed on August 24, 2012 by Petitioners/Plaintiffs-Appellants Alan Goto;
Individually and as Personal Representative of the Estate of Ryan Goto, Deceased; David Bega; Paul Javier; Lon Williams,
Individually and as Personal Representative of the Estate of Alacia Williams; Karin Williams, and Georgie-Ann Goto,

Individually and as Guardian of the Property of Bowen Goto is hereby rejected.

DATED: Honolulu, Hawai'i, October 8, 2012.

James J. Bickerton, for petitioners Alan Goto, David Bega, and Paul Javier

/s/ Simeon R. Acoba, Jr.

/s/ Paula A. Nakayama

James T. Leavitt, Jr., for petitioner Georgie-Ann Goto

/s/ Richard W. Pollack

Charles J. Ferrera, for petitioner Karin Williams

/s/ Jeannette H. Castagnetti

Robin M. Kishi and Caron M. Inagaki, for respondent State of Hawai'i

DISSENT BY RECKTENWALD, C.J.

I respectfully dissent. For the reasons articulated in Chief Judge Nakamura's dissenting opinion in <u>Williams v.</u>

<u>Henderson</u>, No. 29491, 2012 WL 1951389 (App. May 31, 2012) (SDO),

I would grant the petitioners' application.

/s/ Mark E. Recktenwald

