## STATE OF LOUISIANA COURT OF APPEAL, FIRST CIRCUIT

SHARON GRAVES

NO. 2015 CW 0403

**VERSUS** 

USAA CASUALTY INSURANCE COMPANY AND RUTH WONDERGEM

JUN 2'9 2015

In Re:

Ruth Wondergem and United Services Automobile Association, applying for supervisory writs, 19th Judicial District Court, Parish of East Baton Rouge, No. 624,756.

BEFORE:

WHIPPLE, C.J., PETTIGREW AND McDONALD, JJ.

WRIT DENIED.

## VGW

Pettigrew, J., Concurs. I would decline to exercise supervisory jurisdiction in this matter as the criteria set forth in Herlitz Construction Co., Inc. v. Hotel Investors of New Iberia, Inc., 396 So.2d 878 (La. 1981) (per curiam), are not met.

McDonald, J., Dissents and would Grant the Writ. I would grant the writ and reverse the judgment of the trial court dated February 11, 2015 which granted in part respondents, Ronald D. Sylvest, M.D., Becky Croxton, and Louisiana Center for Orthopaedic & Sports Medicine, L.L.C.'s protective order and limited the scope of discovery which may be propounded on them. Relators-defendants have the right to discover and present evidence of respondents' bias. See Rowe v. State Farm Mut. Auto. Ins. Co., 95-669 (La. App. 3d Cir. 3/6/96), 670 So.2d 718, 724, writ denied, 96-0824 (La. 5/17/96), 673 So.2d 611.

COURT OF APPEAL, FIRST CIRCUIT

DEPUTY CLERK OF COURT FOR THE COURT