STATE OF MAINE KENNEBEC, ss.

STATE OF MAINE

v.

ORDER DENYING MOTION TO DISCLOSE GRAND JURY TRANSCRIPTS

SUPERIOR COURT

CRIMINAL ACTION DOCKET NO: CR-10-578 REM - KEN - 7/18/20/1

KEVIN MESERVE, Defendant

Defendant filed his motion to disclose grand jury transcripts on or about May 17, 2011. The court heard further argument from the parties on June 8, 2011.

Defendant contends that the grand jury testimony which may have included testimony from an officer Andrew McMullen should be disclosed to the defendant pursuant to a request made in accordance with M.R.Crim.P. 6(g). Defendant contends a particularized need is established in these circumstances because defendant believes Officer McMullen may have testified as to what he viewed on a video created by the owners of an establishment, Chez Lounge, where the alleged incident which is the subject of the underlying complaint occurred. Defendant further contends that the eventual destruction of the same videotape creates a particularized need for the testimony which may have been presented to the grand jury.

The court is not persuaded that this fact alone creates a particularized need sufficient to justify the production and disclosure of the grand jury transcripts. The mere fact that the officer's testimony, even relating to his observations of the videotape, may conflict or be inconsistent with other witness testimony regarding what occurred, does not create the particularized need which must be demonstrated to approve the defendant's request. *State v. Cugliata*, 372 A.2d. 1019 (ME 1977).

Accordingly, defendant's motion is hereby denied.

Dated: July 18, 2011

Robert E. Murray, Jr. Justice, Superior Court

STATE OF MAINE VS KEVIN MESERVE 702 CHINA ROAD WINSLOW ME 04901 SUPERIOR COURT KENNEBEC, ss. Docket No AUGSC-CR-2010-00578

DOCKET RECORD

State's Attorney: EVERT FOWLE

DOB: 10/05/1960 Attorney: THOMAS HALLETT THE HALLETT LAW FIRM 75 MARKET STREET SUITE 502 PO BOX 7508 PORTLAND ME 04112 RETAINED 08/18/2010

Charge(s)

1 AGGRAVATED ASSAULT 08/04/2010 WAY Seq 629 17-A 208(1)(A) Class B MCMULLEN / WAT	TERVILLE		
Docket Events:			
08/09/2010 FILING DOCUMENT - CASH BAIL BOND FILED ON 08/04/2010			
08/09/2010 BAIL BOND - \$700.00 CASH BAIL BOND FILED ON 08/09/2010			
Bail Receipt Type: CR Bail Amt: \$700			
Receipt Type: CK Date Bailed: 08/04/2010 Prvdr Name: KEVIN MESERVE Rtrn Name: KEVIN MESERVE			
08/18/2010 Party(s): KEVIN MESERVE ATTORNEY - RETAINED ENTERED ON 08/18/2010			
Attorney: THOMAS HALLETT 08/18/2010 MOTION - MOTION TO SUPPRESS FILED BY DEFENDANT ON 08/18/2010			
Attorney: THOMAS HALLETT 08/18/2010 MOTION - MOTION FOR DISCOVERY FILED BY DEFENDANT ON 08/18/2010			
Attorney: THOMAS HALLETT 08/18/2010 MOTION - MOTION TO DISMISS FILED BY DEFENDANT ON 08/18/2010			
Attorney: THOMAS HALLETT 09/10/2010 Charge(s): 1			

SUPPLEMENTAL FILING - COMPLAINT FILED ON 09/10/2010

10/12/2010 Charge(s): 1 HEARING - STATUS CONFERENCE SCHEDULED FOR 12/14/2010 at 10:00 a.m.

10/12/2010 Charge(s): 1 HEARING - STATUS CONFERENCE NOTICE SENT ON 10/12/2010

10/25/2010 MOTION - MOTION FOR GRAND JURY REPORTER FILED BY DEFENDANT ON 10/25/2010 Page 1 of 4 Printed on: 07/22/2011

KEVIN MESERVE AUGSC-CR-2010-00578 DOCKET RECORD

10/25/2010 Charge(s): 1 HEARING - INITIAL APPEARANCE HELD ON 10/12/2010 at 08:30 a.m. DONALD H MARDEN , JUSTICE Defendant Present in Court 10/25/2010 Charge(s): 1 PLEA - NO ANSWER ENTERED BY DEFENDANT ON 10/12/2010 10/25/2010 HEARING - MOTION FOR GRAND JURY REPORTER SCHEDULED FOR 12/14/2010 at 10:00 a.m. NOTICE TO PARTIES/COUNSEL 10/25/2010 HEARING - MOTION FOR GRAND JURY REPORTER NOTICE SENT ON 10/25/2010 12/15/2010 HEARING - MOTION FOR GRAND JURY REPORTER HELD ON 12/14/2010 ROLAND A COLE , JUSTICE Attorney: THOMAS HALLETT DA: BRAD GRANT Defendant Present in Court 12/15/2010 MOTION - MOTION FOR GRAND JURY REPORTER GRANTED ON 12/14/2010 ROLAND A COLE , JUSTICE COPY TO PARTIES/COUNSEL AND COURT REPORTER 12/15/2010 Charge(s): 1 HEARING - STATUS CONFERENCE HELD ON 12/14/2010 ROLAND A COLE , JUSTICE Attorney: THOMAS HALLETT DA: BRAD GRANT Defendant Present in Court 12/15/2010 Charge(s): 1 HEARING - STATUS CONFERENCE SCHEDULED FOR 02/23/2011 at 10:00 a.m. 12/15/2010 Charge(s): 1 HEARING - STATUS CONFERENCE NOTICE SENT ON 12/14/2010 02/23/2011 Charge(s): 1 HEARING - STATUS CONFERENCE HELD ON 02/23/2011 ROBERT E MURRAY JR, JUSTICE Attorney: THOMAS HALLETT DA: BRAD GRANT Defendant Present in Court 02/23/2011 Charge(s): 1 HEARING - STATUS CONFERENCE SCHEDULED FOR 04/26/2011 at 10:00 a.m. 02/23/2011 Charge(s): 1 HEARING - STATUS CONFERENCE NOTICE SENT ON 02/23/2011 04/06/2011 Charge(s): 1 HEARING - STATUS CONFERENCE NOT HELD ON 04/06/2011 04/06/2011 Charge(s): 1 SUPPLEMENTAL FILING - INDICTMENT FILED ON 04/04/2011 04/06/2011 Charge(s): 1 HEARING - ARRAIGNMENT SCHEDULED FOR 04/26/2011 at 10:00 a.m. Page 2 of 4 Printed on: 07/22/2011

KEVIN MESERVE AUGSC-CR-2010-00578 DOCKET RECORD

04/06/2011 Charge(s): 1 HEARING - ARRAIGNMENT NOTICE SENT ON 04/06/2011 04/26/2011 Charge(s): 1 HEARING - ARRAIGNMENT HELD ON 04/26/2011 M MICHAELA MURPHY , JUSTICE DA: BRAD GRANT Reporter: JANETTE COOK Defendant Present in Court READING WAIVED. DEFENDANT INFORMED OF CHARGES. COPY OF INDICTMENT/INFORMATION GIVEN TO DEFENDANT. 21 DAYS TO FILE MOTIONS 04/26/2011 Charge(s): 1 PLEA - NOT GUILTY ENTERED BY DEFENDANT ON 04/26/2011 04/28/2011 MOTION - MOTION TO SUPPRESS FILED BY DEFENDANT ON 04/28/2011 Attorney: THOMAS HALLETT 04/28/2011 MOTION - MOTION FOR DISCOVERY FILED BY DEFENDANT ON 04/28/2011 Attorney: THOMAS HALLETT 04/29/2011 HEARING - MOTION TO SUPPRESS SCHEDULED FOR 06/07/2011 at 11:00 a.m. NOTICE TO PARTIES/COUNSEL 04/29/2011 HEARING - MOTION FOR DISCOVERY SCHEDULED FOR 06/07/2011 at 11:00 a.m. NOTICE TO PARTIES/COUNSEL 05/17/2011 MOTION - MOTION FOR ENLARGEMENT OF TIME FILED BY DEFENDANT ON 05/17/2011 05/17/2011 MOTION - OTHER MOTION FILED BY DEFENDANT ON 05/17/2011 MOTION TO DISCLOSE GRAND JURY TRANSCRIPTS 06/07/2011 HEARING - MOTION FOR DISCOVERY CONTINUED ON 06/07/2011 06/07/2011 HEARING - MOTION FOR DISCOVERY SCHEDULED FOR 06/08/2011 at 10:00 a.m. NOTICE TO PARTIES/COUNSEL 06/07/2011 HEARING - MOTION TO SUPPRESS NOT HELD ON 06/07/2011 06/07/2011 MOTION - MOTION TO SUPPRESS WITHDRAWN ON 06/07/2011 06/07/2011 HEARING - OTHER MOTION SCHEDULED FOR 06/08/2011 at 10:00 a.m. MOTION TO DISCLOSE GRAND JURY TRANSCRIPTS 06/07/2011 HEARING - MOTION FOR ENLARGEMENT OF TIME SCHEDULED FOR 06/08/2011 at 08:30 a.m. NOTICE TO PARTIES/COUNSEL 06/07/2011 HEARING - MOTION TO DISMISS SCHEDULED FOR 06/08/2011 at 10:00 a.m. NOTICE TO PARTIES/COUNSEL 06/07/2011 MOTION - MOTION TO SUPPRESS WITHDRAWN ON 06/07/2011 06/16/2011 MOTION - MOTION FOR DISCOVERY FILED BY DEFENDANT ON 06/15/2011

Page 3 of 4

Printed on: 07/22/2011

KEVIN MESERVE AUGSC-CR-2010-00578 DOCKET RECORD

06/20/2011	AGREED UPON DISCOVERY ORDER MOTION - MOTION FOR DISCOVERY GRANTED ON 06/20/2011 ROBERT E MURRAY JR, JUSTICE	
06/20/2011	COPY TO PARTIES/COUNSEL MOTION - MOTION TO DISMISS WITHDRAWN ON 06/08/2011	
06/20/2011	HEARING - MOTION TO DISMISS NOT HELD ON 06/08/2011	
06/20/2011	HEARING - MOTION FOR DISCOVERY HELD ON 06/08/2011 ROBERT E MURRAY JR, JUSTICE Defendant Present in Court	
06/20/2011	MOTION - MOTION FOR DISCOVERY GRANTED ON 06/08/2011 ROBERT E MURRAY JR, JUSTICE	
	COPY TO PARTIES/COUNSEL SUBMIT PROPOSED ORDER	PARTIES TO
06/20/2011	HEARING - MOTION FOR ENLARGEMENT OF TIME HELD ON 06/08/2011 ROBERT E MURRAY JR, JUSTICE	
06/20/2011	Defendant Present in Court MOTION - MOTION FOR ENLARGEMENT OF TIME GRANTED ON 06/08/2011 ROBERT E MURRAY JR, JUSTICE	
07/20/2011	COPY TO PARTIES/COUNSEL HEARING - OTHER MOTION HELD ON 06/08/2011 ROBERT E MURRAY JR, JUSTICE	
07/20/2011	MOTION TO DISCLOSE GRAND JURY TRANSCRIPTS MOTION - OTHER MOTION DENIED ON 07/18/2011 JANET TIBBETTS , ASSISTANT CLERK-E	
07/22/2011	MOTION TO DISCLOSE GRAND JURY TRANSCRIPTS Charge(s): 1 TRIAL - DOCKET CALL SCHEDULED FOR 09/07/2011	
07/22/2011	ORDER - COURT ORDER FILED ON 07/18/2011 ROBERT E MURRAY JR, JUSTICE ORDER DENYING MOTION TO DISCLOSE GRAND JURY TRANSCRIPTS	
07/22/2011	ORDER - COURT ORDER ENTERED ON 07/18/2011	

A TRUE COPY

ATTEST:

Clerk