

**STATE OF MICHIGAN**  
**COURT OF APPEALS**

---

KEITH A. WAGONER,

Plaintiff-Appellant,

v

NORTHWEST AIRLINES, INC., AMERICAN  
MOTORISTS INSURANCE COMPANY,  
REPUBLIC AIRLINES, and NORTH RIVER  
INSURANCE COMPANY,

Defendant-Appellees.

---

UNPUBLISHED

December 14, 1999

No. 215532

WCAC

LC No. 96-000525

Before: Jansen, P.J., and Saad and Gage, JJ.

PER CURIAM.

SAAD, J. (dissenting).

I respectfully dissent because, like the Worker's Compensation Appellate Commission, though I may not agree with the magistrate's finding that plaintiff's disability is not work related, there was competent, material and substantial evidence to support the magistrate's findings and therefore, we, like the Commission, are bound to affirm.

/s/ Henry William Saad