Montana Water Court PO Box 1389 Bozeman, MT 59771-1389 (406) 586-4364 1-800-624-3270 watercourt@mt.gov FILED
01/29/2024
Sara Calkins
CLERK
Montana Water Court
STATE OF MONTANA
By: D'Ann CIGLER
41K-0015-R-2023
Block, Nathaniel
3.00

IN THE WATER COURT OF THE STATE OF MONTANA
UPPER MISSOURI DIVISION
SUN RIVER BASIN (41K)
PRELIMINARY DECREE

* * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * *

CLAIMANTS: Jerry G. Bowen; Brett R. Fagenstrom;

Kim J. Fagenstrom; Kurt J.

Fagenstrom; John Robert Sechena;

Robert W. Sechena

OBJECTORS: John Robert Sechena; United States of

America (USDA Forest Service)

COUNTEROBJECTORS: John Robert Sechena

CASE 41K-0015-R-2023 41K 30127964

NOTICE OF FILING OF MASTER'S REPORT

This Master's Report was filed with the Montana Water Court on the above stamped date. Please review this report carefully.

You may file a written objection to this Master's Report within **10 days** of the stamped date if you disagree or find errors with the Master's findings of fact, conclusions of law, or recommendations. Rule 23, W.R.Adj.R. If the Master's Report was mailed to you, the Montana Rules of Civil Procedure allow an additional 3 days be added to the 10-day objection period. Rule 6(d), M.R.Civ.P. If you file an objection, you must serve a copy of the objection to all parties on the service list found at the end of the Master's Report. The original objection and a certificate of mailing to all parties on the service list must be filed with the Water Court.

If you do not file a timely objection, the Water Court will conclude that you agree with the content of this Master's Report.

MASTER'S REPORT

The above-captioned claim appeared in the Preliminary Decree for the Sun River (Basin 41K) and received objections from claimant John Robert Sechena and the United States.

Mr. Sechena seeks to modify the point of diversion and places of use while the United States seeks the addition of a remark on the claim clarifying that the "place of use and point of diversion occur entirely on private lands".

On October 30, 2023, the above-captioned claim was consolidated into Water Court Case 41K-0015-R-2023 and on November 30, 2023, the United States' filed a 'Response to Court Order'. The filing stated that the addition of the remark described above would resolve the United States' objection.

FINDINGS OF FACT

1. The places of use and points of diversion should be modified to the following to reflect historical use:

Places of Diversion & Use:

- SE % NE % SW % Section 3 Twp 20 N Range 9 W, Lewis & Clark County SW % NE % SW % Section 3 Twp 20 N Range 9 W, Lewis & Clark County NW % NE % SW % Section 3 Twp 20 N Range 9 W, Lewis & Clark County
- NE ¼ NW ¼ SW ¼ Section 3 Twp 20 N Range 9 W, Lewis & Clark County
 NE ¼ SE ¼ SW ¼ Section 3 Twp 20 N Range 9 W, Lewis & Clark County
- NW X SW X SE X Section 3 Twp 20 N Range 9 W, Lewis & Clark County SW X NW X SE X Section 3 Twp 20 N Range 9 W, Lewis & Clark County
- The following remark should be placed on the claim:
 Place of use and point of diversion occur entirely on private lands
- 3. The issue remark on the claim requires no additional proceedings or information to resolve and should be removed from the claim.

PRINCIPLES OF LAW

1. The Montana Water Court has the authority to determine the extent of all water rights in the state as they existed prior to July 1, 1973. *Fellows v. Saylor*, 2016 MT 45, ¶ 25, 382 Mont. 298, 367 P.3d 732; §§ 85-2-233, -102(12), MCA.

- 2. A properly filed Statement of Claim for Existing Water Right is prima facie proof of its content. § 85-2-227, MCA. This prima facie proof may be contradicted and overcome by other evidence that proves, by a preponderance of the evidence, that the elements of the claim do not accurately reflect the beneficial use of the water right as it existed prior to July 1, 1973. This is the burden of proof for every assertion that a claim is incorrect. Rule 19, W.R.Adj.R.
- 3. Section 3-7-224, MCA the Water Court is directed to conduct hearings in the same manner as for other civil actions. The Water Court applies the Montana Rules of Civil Procedure (M.R.Civ.P.), the Montana Rules of Evidence (M.R.Evid.) and the Montana Uniform District Court Rules. This Master considers documents (including objections) filed with the Court as "other paper" under M.R.Civ.P. Rule 11(b)(3) which certifies that to the best of the parties knowledge the factual contentions contained within the Statement are supported by evidence.
- 4. Add to this rule the recognition that "the heart of a judicial process is the development of the truth through conflict between parties with adverse interests." United States of America (USDI) –Bureau of Indian Affairs)-General Objection to Basin 42B and 42C Preliminary Decrees, Case 42B-1, ¶ 3 at p. 14, (Order Denying Motion June 27, 2014). Considering these tenets, significant weight is given to the filings to establish the accurate historical use of the claims.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

- 1. The places of use and points of diversion should be modified as discussed above.
- 2. The remark discussed above should be placed on the claim.

RECOMMENDATION

1. Upon review the record in this case, the claim should be modified as discussed above. The issue remark should be removed from the claim.

A Post Decree Abstract of Water Right Claim is attached to this Master's Report for review.

ELECTRONICALLY SIGNED AND DATED BELOW.

Service via USPS Mail:

Jerry G. Bowen 1525 16th Ave. SW Great Falls, MT 59404

Brett R. Fagenstrom Kim J. Fagenstrom Kurt J. Fagenstrom PO Box 2623 Great Falls, MT 59403-2623

John Robert Sechena 12208 Greenwood Ave. N Seattle, WA 98133-8106

Robert W. Sechena 1526 Central Ave. Great Falls, MT 59401-3836

Service via Electronic Mail:

Eve McDonald, Attorney
US Dept of Justice-ENRD
999 18th Street, South Terrace Suite 370
Denver, CO 80202
(303) 844-1381
evelyn.mcdonald@usdoj.gov
MontanaBasins.ENRD@USDOJ.GOV

Mark Widerschein, Trial Attorney
US Dept of Justice, ENRD-NRS
PO Box 7611
Washington, DC 20044-7611
(202) 532-5803
Mark.widerschein@usdoj.gov
MontanaBasins.ENRD@USDOJ.GOV

POST DECREE

ABSTRACT OF WATER RIGHT CLAIM

SUN RIVER

BASIN 41K

Water Right Number: 41K 30127964 STATEMENT OF CLAIM

Version: 2 -- POST DECREE

Status: ACTIVE

Owners: JERRY G BOWEN

1525 16TH AVE SW

GREAT FALLS, MT 59404

BRETT R FAGENSTROM

PO BOX 2623

GREAT FALLS, MT 59403-2623

KIM J FAGENSTROM

PO BOX 2623

GREAT FALLS, MT 59403-2623

KURT J FAGENSTROM

PO BOX 2623

GREAT FALLS, MT 59403-2623

JOHN ROBERT SECHENA 12208 GREENWOOD AVE N SEATTLE, WA 98133-8106

ROBERT W SECHENA 1526 CENTRAL AVE

GREAT FALLS, MT 59401-3836

OWNERSHIP UPDATE PROCESSED TO ADD NEW OWNERS. THE WATER RIGHT MAY BE SPLIT INTO SEPARATE WATER RIGHTS UPON REQUEST OF THE OWNERS.

Priority Date: DECEMBER 20, 1919

Type of Historical Right: USE

Purpose (Use): STOCK

Flow Rate: A SPECIFIC FLOW RATE HAS NOT BEEN DECREED BECAUSE THIS USE CONSISTS

OF STOCK DRINKING DIRECTLY FROM THE SOURCE, OR FROM A DITCH SYSTEM. THE FLOW RATE IS LIMITED TO THE MINIMUM AMOUNT HISTORICALLY NECESSARY

TO SUSTAIN THIS PURPOSE.

Volume: THIS RIGHT INCLUDES THE AMOUNT OF WATER CONSUMPTIVELY USED FOR

STOCK WATERING PURPOSES AT THE RATE OF 30 GALLONS PER DAY PER ANIMAL UNIT. ANIMAL UNITS SHALL BE BASED ON REASONABLE CARRYING CAPACITY AND

HISTORICAL USE OF THE AREA SERVICED BY THIS WATER SOURCE.

Source Name: UNNAMED TRIBUTARY OF BEAVER CREEK, WEST FORK

Source Type: SURFACE WATER

Point of Diversion and Means of Diversion:

ID Govt Lot Otr Sec Sec Twp Rge County

1 SENESW 3 20N 9W LEWIS AND CLARK

Period of Diversion: MAY 15 TO OCTOBER 31

Diversion Means:		LIVESTOCK DIRECT FROM SOURCE									
2			SWNESW	3	20N	9W	LEWIS AND CLARK				
Period of Diversion:		MAY 15 TO OC	TOBER 31								
Diversion Means:		LIVESTOCK DIRECT FROM SOURCE									
3			NWNESW	3	20N	9W	LEWIS AND CLARK				
Period of Diversion:		MAY 15 TO OC	TOBER 31								
Diversion Means:		LIVESTOCK DIRECT FROM SOURCE									
4			NENWSW	3	20N	9W	LEWIS AND CLARK				
Period of Diversion:		MAY 15 TO OC	TOBER 31								
Diversion Means:		LIVESTOCK DIRECT FROM SOURCE									
5			NESESW	3	20N	9W	LEWIS AND CLARK				
Period of Diversion:		MAY 15 TO OC	TOBER 31								
Diversion Means:		LIVESTOCK DIRECT FROM SOURCE									
6			NWSWSE	3	20N	9W	LEWIS AND CLARK				
Period of Diversion:		MAY 15 TO OC	TOBER 31								
Diversion Means:		LIVESTOCK DIRECT FROM SOURCE									
7			SWNWSE	3	20N	9W	LEWIS AND CLARK				
Period of Diversion:		MAY 15 TO OC	TOBER 31								
Diversion Means:		LIVESTOCK DIRECT FROM SOURCE									
Period of Use:		MAY 15 TO OCTOBER 31									
Place of Use:											
<u>ID</u>	Acres	Govt Lot	Qtr Sec	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	Rge	County				
1			SENESW	3	20N	9W	LEWIS AND CLARK				
0			CVA/NIECVA/	2	OONI	ΩM	LEWIC AND OLADIA				

Pl

<u>ID</u>	<u>Acres</u>	Govt Lot	<u> Qtr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	<u>County</u>
1			SENESW	3	20N	9W	LEWIS AND CLARK
2			SWNESW	3	20N	9W	LEWIS AND CLARK
3			NWNESW	3	20N	9W	LEWIS AND CLARK
4			NENWSW	3	20N	9W	LEWIS AND CLARK
5			NESESW	3	20N	9W	LEWIS AND CLARK
6			NWSWSE	3	20N	9W	LEWIS AND CLARK
7			SWNWSE	3	20N	9W	LEWIS AND CLARK

Remarks:

PLACE OF USE AND POINT OF DIVERSION OCCUR ENTIRELY ON PRIVATE LANDS.