FILED 01/11/2024 Sara Calkins CLERK Montana Water Court STATE OF MONTANA By: Regina Certalic 42M-0046-I-2023 Stern, Anika 4.00

Montana Water Court PO Box 1389 Bozeman, MT 59771-1389 (406) 586-4364 1-800-624-3270 watercourt@mt.gov

#### IN THE WATER COURT OF THE STATE OF MONTANA YELLOWSTONE RIVER BELOW POWDER RIVER - BASIN (42M) INTERLOCUTORY DECREE \*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*

CLAIMANTS: Delbert D. Hoffer; Lavonne Hoffer

CASE 42M-0046-I-2023 42M 30145119 42M 30145125 42M 30145127 42M 30145128 42M 30145875 42M 30145876

### NOTICE OF FILING OF MASTER'S REPORT

This Master's Report was filed with the Montana Water Court on the above-stamped date. <u>Please review this report carefully.</u>

You may file a written objection to this Master's Report within **10 days** of the stamped date if you disagree or find errors with the Master's findings of fact, conclusions of law, or recommendations. Rule 23, W.R.Adj.R. If the Master's Report was mailed to you, the Montana Rules of Civil Procedure allow an additional 3 days be added to the 10-day objection period. Rule 6(d), M.R.Civ.P. If you file an objection, you must serve a copy of the objection to all parties on the service list found at the end of the Master's Report. The original objection and a certificate of mailing to all parties on the service list must be filed with the Water Court.

If you do not file a timely objection, the Water Court will conclude that you agree with the content of this Master's Report.

### **MASTER'S REPORT**

### FINDINGS OF FACT

1. Lavonne Hoffer and Delbert D. Hoffer are the record owners of claims 42M

30145119, 42M 30145125, 42M 30145127, 42M 30145128, 42M 30145875, and 42M 30145876.

2. Claims 42M 30145119, 42M 30145125, 42M 30145127, 42M 30145128,

42M 30145875, and 42M 30145876 were decreed with DNRC issue remarks:

#### 42M 30145119:

THE WATER RIGHTS LISTED FOLLOWING THIS STATEMENT APPEAR TO BE REDUNDANT FILINGS. IT APPEARS ONLY ONE WATER RIGHT IS INVOLVED. 42M 177000-00, 42M 30145119.

#### 42M 30145125:

NO FLOW RATE HAS BEEN CLAIMED. THE FLOW RATE GUIDELINE FOR THIS PURPOSE IS 35 GPM.

THE CLAIMS LISTED FOLLOWING THIS STATEMENT MAY BE A MULTIPLE USE OF THE SAME RIGHT. THESE CLAIMS MAY NEED A MULTIPLE USE REMARK. 42M 30145125, 42M 30145875.

THE POINT OF DIVERSION LEGAL LAND DESCRIPTION COULD NOT BE REFINED FROM INFORMATION IN THE CLAIM FILE.

THE PLACE OF USE LEGAL LAND DESCRIPTION COULD NOT BE REFINED FROM INFORMATION IN THE CLAIM FILE.

#### 42M 30145127:

NO TYPE OF HISTORICAL RIGHT WAS CLAIMED. DOCUMENTATION TO SUPPORT THE TYPE OF HISTORICAL RIGHT WAS NOT SUBMITTED WITH THIS CLAIM.

#### 42M 30145128:

THE TYPE OF HISTORICAL RIGHT AND PRIORITY DATE MAY BE QUESTIONABLE. DOCUMENTATION TO SUPPORT THE TYPE OF HISTORICAL RIGHT AND PRIORITY DATE WAS NOT SUBMITTED WITH THIS CLAIM. NO PRIORITY DATE WAS CLAIMED.

#### 42M 30145875:

THE CLAIMS LISTED FOLLOWING THIS STATEMENT MAY BE A MULTIPLE USE OF THE SAME RIGHT. THESE CLAIMS MAY NEED A MULTIPLE USE REMARK. 42M 30145125, 42M 30145875.

#### 42M 30145876:

THE WATER RIGHTS LISTED FOLLOWING THIS STATEMENT APPEAR TO BE REDUNDANT FILINGS. IT APPEARS ONLY ONE WATER RIGHT IS INVOLVED. 42M 176999-00, 42M 30145876.

Additionally, the claims were decreed with a remark indicating they were not included in the 2014 decree in Basin 42M.

3. Claimants Lavonne Hoffer and Delbert D. Hoffer were ordered to meet

with the DNRC to address the unresolved issue remarks.

4. On December 4, 2023, DNRC Water Resource Specialist Ryan Hartwell

filed a Memorandum stating he discussed the issue remarks with Claimant Delbert D.

Hoffer and reviewed the claim files. (Doc. 12.00). Based on his discussion with Mr. Hoffer, Mr. Hartwell recommended the following changes be made to claims 42M 30145119, 42M 30145125, 42M 30145127, 42M 30145128, 42M 30145875, and 42M 30145876, addressing the issue remarks:

#### 42M 30145119:

Claim should be dismissed.

#### 42M 30145125:

Flow Rate: 14.00 GPM Point of diversion and place of use should be modified to: ID Govt Lot Qtr Sec Sec Twp Rge County SWSE 20 12N 55E PRAIRIE 1 A multiple use remark should be added, indicating the claim is a multiple use of 42M 30145875.

#### 42M 30145127:

Type of Historical Right: USE

#### 42M 30145128:

Priority Date:

DECEMBER 31, 1925

#### 42M 30145875:

A multiple use remark should be added, indicating the claim is a multiple use of 42M 30145825.

#### 42M 30145876:

No changes.

5. To determine if Claimants Lavonne Hoffer and Delbert D. Hoffer agreed or disagreed with the recommended modifications, an Order was issued setting a deadline for the Claimants to agree or disagree with the modifications recommended by Mr. Hartwell. The Order indicated that if nothing were filed by the deadline, this Water Master would conclude the Claimants agree the recommended modifications should be made to the claims in this Case. The following language was included in the Order:

<sup>1 &</sup>quot;Doc." numerical references correlate to case file docket numbers in the Water Court's Full Court case management system.

Failure to comply with the terms of this Order may result in sanctions, <u>up to and</u> <u>including entry of default and termination of a water right claim or dismissal of</u> <u>objections</u>. Rule 22, W.R.Adj.R.

Nothing was filed.

## PRINCIPLES AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

1. The Water Court must address all issue remarks decreed on a claim. Section 85-2-248, MCA.

2. A properly filed Statement of Claim for an existing water right is prima facie proof of its content. Section 85-2-227, MCA. This prima facie validity may be overcome by evidence showing that one or more elements of the claim are incorrect. This standard of proof applies to objectors or claimants objecting to their own water right claims. Rule 19, W.R.Adj.R., *Nelson v. Brooks*, 2014 MT 120; 375 Mont.86, 95; 329 P.3d 558, 564.

3. The issue remark indicating claims 42M 30145119, 42M 30145125, 42M 30145127, 42M 30145128, 42M 30145875, and 42M 30145876 were not included in the 2014 decree are notice-type remarks. No objections were filed, and no further proceedings are required.

## **RECOMMENDATIONS**

- 1. Claim 42M 30145119 should be dismissed.
- 2. Claim 42M 30145125 should be modified as follows:

Flow Rate: 14.00 GPM Point of diversion and place of use should be modified to: Govt Lot ID Qtr Sec Sec Twp Rge County SWSE 1 20 12N 55E PRAIRIE A multiple use remark should be added, indicating the claim is a multiple use of 42M 30145875.

Claim 42M 30145127 should be modified as follows:

Type of Historical Right: USE

Claim 42M 30145128 should be modified as follows: Priority Date: DECEMBER 31, 1925 A multiple use remark should be added to claim 42M 30145875, indicating the claim is a multiple use of claim 30145125.

3. The issue remarks should be removed from the claims in the Case.

Post Decree Abstracts of Water Right Claims are served with the Report for review.

## ELECTRONICALLY SIGNED AND DATED BELOW.

### Service via USPS Mail:

Delbert D. Hoffer Lavonne Hoffer 31 Hatchet Circle Loop Glendive, MT 59330-7001

## POST DECREE ABSTRACT OF WATER RIGHT CLAIM YELLOWSTONE RIVER, BELOW POWDER RIVER BASIN 42M 42M 30145119 STATEMENT OF CLAIM

Water Right Number:	42M 3014	5119	STA	TEMENT OF CLAIM
	Version:	2	POS	T DECREE
		Stat	us:	DISMISSED
Owners:	DELBERT 31 HATCH GLENDIVE	ET CF	REEK	LOOP RD
	LAVONNE 31 HATCH GLENDIVE	ET CF	REEK	
*Priority Date:				
Type of Historical Right:				
Purpose (Use):	DOMESTIC	2		
Flow Rate:				
Volume:				
Source Name:	GROUNDV	VATE	R	
Source Type:	GROL	INDW	ATEF	R
Point of Diversion and Means	of Diversion	:		
Period of Use:				
Place of Use:				

#### **Remarks:**

THIS CLAIM WAS DISMISSED BY ORDER OF THE WATER COURT.

Water Right Number:	42M 30145	5 <b>125</b> ST	ATEMENT	OF CL/	AIM				
	Version:	Version: 2 POST DECREE							
		Status:	ACTIVE						
Owners:	31 HATCHI	DELBERT D HOFFER 31 HATCHET CREEK LOOP RD GLENDIVE, MT 59330-7001							
	31 HATCHI	LAVONNE HOFFER 31 HATCHET CREEK LOOP RD GLENDIVE, MT 59330-7001							
*Priority Date:	DECEMBE	R 31, 191	0						
Type of Historical Right:	USE								
Purpose (Use):	STOCK	STOCK							
Flow Rate:	14.00 GPM	14.00 GPM							
*Volume:	THIS RIGHT INCLUDES THE AMOUNT OF WATER CONSUMPTIVELY USED FOR STOCK WATERING PURPOSES AT THE RATE OF 30 GALLONS PER DAY PER ANIMAL UNIT. ANIMAL UNITS SHALL BE BASED ON REASONABLE CARRYING CAPACITY AND HISTORICAL USE OF THE AREA SERVICED BY THIS WATER SOURCE.								
Source Name:	GROUNDV	/ATER							
Source Type:	GROU	GROUNDWATER							
Point of Diversion and Mear	ns of Diversion								
ID	<u>Govt Lo</u>	<u>t</u>	<u>Qtr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	County		
1			SWSE	20	12N	55E	PRAIRIE		
Period of Diversion:		JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31							
<b>Diversion Means:</b>	WELL								
Period of Use:	JANUARY	JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31							
Place of Use:									
<u>ID</u> <u>Acr</u> 1	<u>es</u> <u>Govt Lo</u>	<u>t</u>	<u>Qtr Sec</u> SWSE	<u>Sec</u> 20	<u>Twp</u> 12N	<u>Rge</u> 55E	<u>County</u> PRAIRIE		

#### **Remarks:**

THE WATER RIGHTS LISTED FOLLOWING THIS STATEMENT ARE MULTIPLE USES OF THE SAME RIGHT. THE USE OF THIS RIGHT FOR SEVERAL PURPOSES DOES NOT INCREASE THE EXTENT OF THE WATER RIGHT. RATHER IT DECREES THE RIGHT TO ALTERNATE AND EXCHANGE THE USE (PURPOSE) OF THE WATER IN ACCORD WITH HISTORICAL PRACTICES.

30145125 30145875

Water Right Number:	42M 30145	127 ST	ATEMENT	OF CLA	MM				
	Version:	Version: 2 POST DECREE							
		Status:	ACTIVE						
Owners:	31 HATCHE	DELBERT D HOFFER 31 HATCHET CREEK LOOP RD GLENDIVE, MT 59330-7001							
	31 HATCHE	LAVONNE HOFFER 31 HATCHET CREEK LOOP RD GLENDIVE, MT 59330-7001							
*Priority Date:	DECEMBEI	R 31, 1903	3						
Type of Historical Right:	USE								
Purpose (Use):	STOCK								
Flow Rate:	15.00 GPM	15.00 GPM							
*Volume:	STOCK WA	THIS RIGHT INCLUDES THE AMOUNT OF WATER CONSUMPTIVELY USED FOR STOCK WATERING PURPOSES AT THE RATE OF 30 GALLONS PER DAY PER ANIMAL UNIT. ANIMAL UNITS SHALL BE BASED ON REASONABLE CARRYING CAPACITY AND HISTORICAL USE OF THE AREA SERVICED BY THIS WATER SOURCE.							
Source Name:	GROUNDW	ATER							
Source Type:	GROU	NDWATE	R						
*Point of Diversion and Mea	ns of Diversion:								
<u>ID</u> 1	<u>Govt Lo</u>		<u>Qtr Sec</u> VSWNW	<u>Sec</u> 8	<u>Twp</u> 12N	<u>Rge</u> 54E	<u>County</u> PRAIRIE		
Period of Diversion:	JANUARY '	I TO DEC	EMBER 31						
<b>Diversion Means:</b>	WELL								
Period of Use:	JANUARY '	I TO DEC	EMBER 31						
*Place of Use:									
<u>ID</u> <u>Ac</u> 1	res <u>Govt Lor</u>	ţ	<u>Qtr Sec</u> SWNW	<u>Sec</u> 8	<u>Twp</u> 12N	<u>Rge</u> 54E	<u>County</u> PRAIRIE		

Water Right Number:	42M 30145 Version:	<b>5128</b> STATEMENT 2 POST DECRE		AIM					
		Status: ACTIVE							
Owners:	31 HATCHE	DELBERT D HOFFER 31 HATCHET CREEK LOOP RD GLENDIVE, MT 59330-7001							
		HOFFER ET CREEK LOOP R , MT 59330-7001	D						
Priority Date:	DECEMBEI	R 31, 1925							
Type of Historical Right:	USE								
Purpose (Use):	STOCK								
Flow Rate:	6.00 GPM								
*Volume:	STOCK WA UNIT. ANIM	TERING PURPOSE	ES AT TI BE BASE	HE RATE ED ON R	E OF 30 EASON	DNSUMPTIVELY USED FOR GALLONS PER DAY PER ANIMAL ABLE CARRYING CAPACITY AND WATER SOURCE.			
Source Name:	GROUNDW	/ATER							
Source Type:	GROU	NDWATER							
*Point of Diversion and Mea	ans of Diversion:	:							
ID	Govt Lo	t <u>Qtr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	County			
1		NENWNE	32	12N	55E	PRAIRIE			
Period of Diversion:		1 TO DECEMBER 3	1						
<b>Diversion Means:</b>	WELL								
Period of Use:	JANUARY '	1 TO DECEMBER 3	1						
*Place of Use:									
<u>ID</u> <u>Ac</u> 1	eres <u>Govt Lo</u> r	t Qtr Sec NENWNE	<u>Sec</u> 32	<u>Twp</u> 12N	<u>Rge</u> 55E	<u>County</u> PRAIRIE			

Water Right Number:

## POST DECREE ABSTRACT OF WATER RIGHT CLAIM YELLOWSTONE RIVER, BELOW POWDER RIVER BASIN 42M 42M 30145875 STATEMENT OF CLAIM

Water Right Number:	42M 30145	42M 30145875 STATEMENT OF CLAIM							
	Version:	Version: 2 POST DECREE							
		Status:	ACTIVE						
Owners:	31 HATCHE	DELBERT D HOFFER 31 HATCHET CREEK LOOP RD GLENDIVE, MT 59330-7001							
	31 HATCHE	LAVONNE HOFFER 31 HATCHET CREEK LOOP RD GLENDIVE, MT 59330-7001							
*Priority Date:	DECEMBEI	R 31, 1910	)						
Type of Historical Right	t: USE								
Purpose (Use):	DOMESTIC	:							
Flow Rate:	14.00 GPM								
Volume:	1.50 AC-FT	1.50 AC-FT							
Households:	1	1							
Maximum Acres:	5.00	5.00							
Source Name:	GROUNDW	GROUNDWATER							
Source Type:	GROU	GROUNDWATER							
*Point of Diversion and N	Aeans of Diversion:								
<u>ID</u> 1	<u>Govt Lo</u>	_	<u>Qtr Sec</u> WSWSE	<u>Sec</u> 20	<u>Twp</u> 12N	<u>Rge</u> 55E	<u>County</u> PRAIRIE		
Period of Diversion:	JANUARY <sup>·</sup>	JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31							
<b>Diversion Means:</b>	WELL	WELL							
Period of Use:	JANUARY <sup>·</sup>	JANUARY 1 TO DECEMBER 31							
*Place of Use:									
<u>ID</u> 1 Total:	Acres Govt Lo 5.00 5.00	t	<u>Qtr Sec</u> SWSE	<u>Sec</u> 20	<u>Twp</u> 12N	<u>Rge</u> 55E	<u>County</u> PRAIRIE		

#### **Remarks:**

THE WATER RIGHTS LISTED FOLLOWING THIS STATEMENT ARE MULTIPLE USES OF THE SAME RIGHT. THE USE OF THIS RIGHT FOR SEVERAL PURPOSES DOES NOT INCREASE THE EXTENT OF THE WATER RIGHT. RATHER IT DECREES THE RIGHT TO ALTERNATE AND EXCHANGE THE USE (PURPOSE) OF THE WATER IN ACCORD WITH HISTORICAL PRACTICES.

30145125 30145875

Water Right Number:	42M 30145	876 ST	ATEMENT	OF CLA	AIM					
	Version: 2 POST DECREE									
		Status:	ACTIVE							
Owners:	31 HATCHE	DELBERT D HOFFER 31 HATCHET CREEK LOOP RD GLENDIVE, MT 59330-7001								
	31 HATCHE	LAVONNE HOFFER 31 HATCHET CREEK LOOP RD GLENDIVE, MT 59330-7001								
*Priority Date:	DECEMBEI	R 31, 1943	3							
Type of Historical Right:	USE									
Purpose (Use):	STOCK	STOCK								
Flow Rate:	14.00 GPM	14.00 GPM								
*Volume:	THIS RIGHT INCLUDES THE AMOUNT OF WATER CONSUMPTIVELY USED FOR STOCK WATERING PURPOSES AT THE RATE OF 30 GALLONS PER DAY PER ANIMAL UNIT. ANIMAL UNITS SHALL BE BASED ON REASONABLE CARRYING CAPACITY AND HISTORICAL USE OF THE AREA SERVICED BY THIS WATER SOURCE.									
Source Name:	GROUNDW	GROUNDWATER								
Source Type:	GROU	GROUNDWATER								
*Point of Diversion and Mean	s of Diversion:									
ID	Govt Lo	<u>t</u>	<u>Qtr Sec</u>	<u>Sec</u>	<u>Twp</u>	<u>Rge</u>	County			
1	1		VNWNW	30	13N	53E	PRAIRIE			
Period of Diversion:	JANUARY '	I TO DEC	EMBER 31							
<b>Diversion Means:</b>	WELL									
Period of Use:	JANUARY '	I TO DEC	EMBER 31							
*Place of Use:										
<u>ID</u> <u>Acre</u> 1	<u>s Govt Lo</u> 1	-	<u>Qtr Sec</u> NWNW	<u>Sec</u> 30	<u>Twp</u> 13N	<u>Rge</u> 53E	<u>County</u> PRAIRIE			

**Remarks:** 

THE WATER RIGHTS LISTED FOLLOWING THIS STATEMENT ARE MULTIPLE USES OF THE SAME RIGHT. THE USE OF THIS RIGHT FOR SEVERAL PURPOSES DOES NOT INCREASE THE EXTENT OF THE WATER RIGHT. RATHER IT DECREES THE RIGHT TO ALTERNATE AND EXCHANGE THE USE (PURPOSE) OF THE WATER IN ACCORD WITH HISTORICAL PRACTICES.

30145119 30145876

THIS WATER RIGHT IS ASSOCIATED WITH WATER RIGHT NO. 42M 30007869 . THEY ARE BASED ON THE SAME HISTORIC WATER RIGHT.