New York City Hous. Auth. v McBride

2018 NY Slip Op 32390(U)

September 21, 2018

Supreme Court, New York County

Docket Number: 450041/2018

Judge: Kathryn E. Freed

Cases posted with a "30000" identifier, i.e., 2013 NY Slip Op 30001(U), are republished from various New York State and local government sources, including the New York State Unified Court System's eCourts Service.

This opinion is uncorrected and not selected for official publication.

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 31

ΔM

NO. 450041/2018

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 09/25/2018

SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK NEW YORK COUNTY

PRESENT:	HON. KATHRYN E. FREED		PART	450041/2018
		Justice		
		X	INDEX NO.	
NEW YORK (CITY HOUSING AUTHORITY,		MOTION DATE	
	Plaintiff,		MOTION SEQ. NO.	001
0.44.0.05.4400	- V -			
CAMMIE MCI	BRIDE and FRANK MCBRIDE,	_		
	Defendants.	· · ·	DECISION AND ORDER	
		X		
The following	e-filed documents, listed by NYSCE	document nur	mber (Motion 001) 28,	29
were read on	this motion to/for	[DEFAULT JUDGMEN	Γ
Upon the for	egoing documents the motion is g	ranted withou	ut opposition.	

In this action seeking unpaid monies due pursuant to a "Stipulation as to Monies Owed," plaintiff New York City Housing Authority (hereinafter "NYCHA") moves, pursuant to CPLR 3215, for a default judgment as against defendant Cammie McBride ("Cammie") and further asks that the action against defendant Frank McBride ("Frank") be severed and preserved. After a review of plaintiff's motion papers, as well as the relevant statutes and case law, the motion, which is unopposed, is **granted**.

FACTUAL AND PROCEDURAL BACKGROUND:

Plaintiff, a public corporation in New York City, administers the Section 8 Housing Assistance Program, which is established to provide, *inter alia*, housing for tenants who qualify for rent subsidies based on their reported incomes. Plaintiff determined that the defendants, who

450041/2018 NEW YORK CITY HOUSING vs. MCBRIDE, CAMMIE Motion No. 001

Page 1 of 4

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 31

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 09/25/2018

were recipients of a Section 8 subsidy, had submitted false financial statements about their income and had therefore received excess support payments or paid a lesser rent than they were entitled to, resulting in defendants owing plaintiffs the sum of \$33,841.00 in overpayments. The defendants acknowledged this "Total Overpayment" and executed a "Stipulation as to Monies Owed the New York City Housing Authority" on August 28, 2006. Doc. No. 2. Defendants agreed to pay the amount owed in \$150.00 monthly installments. However, the defendants defaulted in the payments. The last payment tendered was June 6, 2012, leaving an amount of \$26,866.00 due and owing. Púrsuant to the terms of the said agreement, the entire amount is now due and payable due to the default.

This action was commenced by the filing of a summons and verified complaint on December 19, 2017. Doc. No. 1. An Affidavit of Service, attesting to service on a person of suitable age and discretion, was made on Cammie on January 27, 2018, with an additional mailing on January 30, 2018, and was filed with the Court on February 6, 2018. Doc. No. 4. The process server also attests that he asked the person on whom he served process, allegedly a relative of defendant Cammie, if she was either in the military service of the United States or a dependant of someone in the military, to which he responded in the negative. Id.

Plaintiff now moves, pursuant to CPLR 3215, for a default judgment against Cammie. In support of the motion, plaintiff submits, among other things, an affirmation of its attorney, Javier O. Hidalgo, Esq., an associate of the law firm of Simon Meyrowitz & Meyrowitz, P.C., who attests that plaintiff has complied with CPLR 3215, that defendant's time to answer or otherwise respond has elapsed, and that defendant has failed to interpose an answer. An affidavit of service

Page 2 of 4

COUNTY CLERK

450041/2018

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 09/25/2018

of the within motion is annexed as Doc. No. 26. In addition to the affirmation of Hidalgo, an

affirmation of Maria Lopez, the Assistant Director of the Revenue and Receivables for NYCHA.

is also annexed to the motion. Doc. No. 20. Lopez attests to having examined plaintiff's records

and to the accuracy of the complaint.

LEGAL CONSIDERATIONS:

CPLR 3215(a) provides, in pertinent part, that "[w]hen a defendant has failed to appear,

plead or proceed to trial..., the plaintiff may seek a default judgment against him." It is well settled

that "[o]n a motion for leave to enter a default judgment pursuant to CPLR 3215, the movant is

required to submit proof of service of the summons and complaint, proof of the facts constituting

the claim, and proof of the defaulting party's default in answering or appearing." Atlantic Cas.

Ins. Co. v RJNJ Servs. Inc., 89 AD3d 649, 651 (2d Dept 2011). Moreover, a default in answering

the complaint is deemed to be an admission of all factual statements contained in the complaint

and all reasonable inferences that flow from them. See Woodson v Mendon Leasing Corp., 100

NY2d 63 (2003).

Here, plaintiff has submitted proof of service of the summons and complaint on defendant

Cammie as well as proof of his failure to answer or otherwise appear in this action. Further,

through the affidavit of Lopez and the affirmation its attorney in support of the motion, plaintiff

has established the facts giving rise to the claim. Therefore, plaintiff is entitled to a default

judgment against Cammie McBride in the amount of \$26,866.00 plus interest from July 15, 2012.

The action is severed and will continue as to plaintiff's claims against defendant Frank McBride.

450041/2018 NEW YORK CITY HOUSING vs. MCBRIDE, CAMMIE

Page 3 of 4

Motion No. 001

INDEX NO. 450041/2018

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 31

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 09/25/2018

Therefore, in light of the foregoing, it is hereby:

ORDERED that the motion by plaintiff New York City Housing Authority for a default judgment against defendant Cammie McBride is granted in the amount of \$26,866.00, plus interest from July 15, 2012, as calculated by the Clerk; and it is further,

ORDERED that plaintiff New York City Housing Authority shall serve a copy of this order on the Trial Support Office at 60 Centre Street, Room 158, as well as on defendants Cammie McBride and Frank McBride; and it is further,

ORDERED that the action is severed and will continue as to plaintiff's claims against defendant Frank McBride; and it is further

ORDERED that this constitutes the decision and order of this Court.

9/21/2018	-				
DATE				KATHRYN E. FREE	D, J.S.C.
CHECK ONE:		CASE DISPOSED	х	NON-FINAL DISPOSITION	
	X	GRANTED DENIED		GRANTED IN PART	OTHER
APPLICATION:		SETTLE ORDER		SUBMIT ORDER	
CHECK IF APPROPRIATE:		INCLUDES TRANSFER/REASSIGN		FIDUCIARY APPOINTMENT	REFERENCE