Aren	t Fox	LLP \	/ JDN	AA.	LLC
,				, w v	

2019 NY Slip Op 32968(U)

October 10, 2019

Supreme Court, New York County

Docket Number: 151654/2018

Judge: David Benjamin Cohen

Cases posted with a "30000" identifier, i.e., 2013 NY Slip Op 30001(U), are republished from various New York State and local government sources, including the New York State Unified Court System's eCourts Service.

This opinion is uncorrected and not selected for official publication.

NVCCEE DOC NO 247

INDEX NO. 151654/2018

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 10/11/2019

SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK NEW YORK COUNTY

PRESENT:	HON. JOEL M. COHEN	PART	IAS MOTION 3EFI	
	Justice			
	X	INDEX NO.	151654/2018	
ARENT FOX	CLLP,	MOTION DATE	09/24/2019	
	Plaintiff,	MOTION SEQ. NO	008	
	- V -			
	C D/B/A AUDI/NEWTON, SUBARU 46 LLC, and MOTIVE LLC	DECISION +		
	Defendant.			
	X			
The following 238, 239, 240	e-filed documents, listed by NYSCEF document nu), 241, 242	mber (Motion 008) 2	234, 235, 236, 237,	
were read on	this motion for R	RELIEF OF ATTORNEY		
Upon the for	egoing documents:			

This action was commenced by Arent Fox LLP against Defendants for nonpayment of legal fees. The firm asserts claims for breach of contract, account stated, quantum meruit, unjust enrichment, and promissory estoppel. Discovery has been concluded in this action and Note of Issue has been filed. A pre-trial Conference has not yet been scheduled.

Now before the Court is the motion by Defendants' counsel, Brach Eichler LLC ("Brach Eichler"), to be relieved as counsel pursuant to CPLR §321 (b)(2). Plaintiff opposes this motion. For the following reasons, Defendants motion is Granted.

Brach Eichler cites to a breakdown in the attorney client relationship as its reason for being unable to continue to work with Defendants. *Suriano Aff.*, ¶4 (NYSCEF 236) and *Suriano Reply Aff.*, ¶3. (NYSCEF 241).

Relieving counsel from its representation of a party is appropriate where, *inter alia*, there is adequate evidence showing a breakdown in the attorney-client relationship. *Robinson v*

151654/2018 ARENT FOX LLP vs. SUBARU 46 LLC, Motion No. 008

Page 1 of 4

FILED: NEW YORK COUNTY CLERK 10/11/2019 11:39 AM

NVSCEE DOC NO 247

INDEX NO. 151654/2018

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 10/11/2019

Friedman Mgt. Corp., 49 A.D. 3d 436, 437 (1st Dep't 2008); see also Bok v Werner, 9 A.D.3d 318 (1st Dep't 2004) (reversing denial of motion to withdraw as counsel in view of counsel's claimed breakdown in relationship with client). Movant has done so. Given that the case has not been scheduled for trial and there are no pending dispositive motions and discovery has concluded, Defendants should not be prejudiced by a change in counsel.

Plaintiff's opposition to this motion largely concerns the potential litigation delay that may result from Brach Eichler's request. While a stay has been requested by Brach Eisler, the Court does not find awarding such a brief stay will delay the trial of this matter or resolution of this matter. There are currently no pending appearances nor is there a trial date on the calendar.

The Court concludes that Brach Eichler has made a sufficient showing of entitlement to withdraw as counsel for Defendants and its motion is Granted. Brach Eichler is directed to advise Defendants that, as corporate Defendants, they may not appear *pro se* and must retain new counsel. *See* CPLR §321(a). Brach Eichler is also directed to comply with its obligation under Rule 1.16(d) of the Rules of Professional Conduct as stated below.

It is therefore:

ORDERED that the motion of Brach Eichler LLC to be relieved as attorney for Defendants in this action is granted, subject to the following conditions:

ORDERED that Brach Eichler LLC is to comply with its obligation under Rule 1.16(d) of the Rules of Professional Conduct, as applicable to the facts presented, to "take steps, to the extent reasonably practicable, to avoid foreseeable prejudice to the rights of the clients, including giving reasonable notice to the clients, allowing time for employment of other counsel, delivering to the clients all papers and property to which the clients is entitled, promptly

151654/2018 ARENT FOX LLP vs. SUBARU 46 LLC, Motion No. 008

Page 2 of 4

FILED: NEW YORK COUNTY CLERK 10/11/2019 11:39 AM

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 247

INDEX NO. 151654/2018

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 10/11/2019

refunding any part of a fee paid in advance that has not been earned and complying with

applicable laws and rules."; it is further

ORDERED that, within 10 days from entry, Brach Eicher LLC shall serve a copy of this

order with notice of entry upon Defendants by email and by hard copy at their last known address

by certified mail, return receipt requested, and upon the attorneys for all other parties appearing

herein by posting to the New York State Courts Electronic Filing System; it is further

ORDERED that, together with the copy of this order with notice of entry served upon all

parties, moving counsel shall forward a notice directing Defendants to appoint a substitute attorney

within 30 days from the date of the mailing of the notice and Defendants shall comply therewith;

it is further

ORDERED that any new attorney retained by Defendants shall file a notice of appearance

with the Clerk of the General Clerk's Office (60 Centre Street, Room 119) and the Clerk of the

Part within 30 days from the date the notice to retain new counsel is served; it is further

ORDERED that no further proceedings may be taken against Defendants without leave of

this court for a period of 30 days after service on Defendants of the aforesaid notice to appoint a

substitute attorney; it is further

ORDERED that the departing attorney shall, within 10 days from entry, serve a copy of

this order with notice of entry on the Clerk of the General Clerk's Office (Room 119); and it is

further

ORDERED that such service upon the Clerk of the General Clerk's Office, the filing of a

notice of appearance as provided herein, and the filing of papers as aforesaid shall be made in

accordance with the procedures set forth in the Protocol on Courthouse and County Clerk

151654/2018 ARENT FOX LLP vs. SUBARU 46 LLC, Motion No. 008

Page 3 of 4

3 of 4

FILED: NEW YORK COUNTY CLERK 10/11/2019 11:39 AM

NYSCEE DOC NO 247

INDEX NO. 151654/2018

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 10/11/2019

Procedures for Electronically Filed Cases (accessible at the "E-Filing" page on the court's website at the address www.nycourts.gov/supctmanh); and it is further

ORDERED that all parties are to appear on November 26, 2019 at 11:30 a.m. in Room 222 for a Pre-Trial Conference.

10/10/2019 DATE	-	JOEL M. COHEN, J.S.C.
CHECK ONE:	CASE DISPOSED X GRANTED DENIED	X NON-FINAL DISPOSITION GRANTED IN PART OTHER
APPLICATION: CHECK IF APPROPRIATE:	SETTLE ORDER INCLUDES TRANSFER/REASSIGN	SUBMIT ORDER FIDUCIARY APPOINTMENT REFERENCE